Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-1 Score 4

Demonstrates effective analysis of text and skillful writing.  This response shows evidence of preplanning. Insight is presented in the effective introduction and there is skillful and seamless integration of text information and analysis.

- **Effectively addresses all parts of the task.** The student focuses on how pizza is made, connecting the ideas of specific rules with changes that have occurred and the creativity required. Ideas are supported with thorough analysis and substantial text support.

- **Thorough and insightful analysis based on explicit and implicit meanings from the text** The student begins with a discussion of the rules “These are like specific rules to follow for different types of art” and follows with the idea of change “started gaining fame as more people from Italy started remaking their masterpiece … following the rules to make it the best way possible.” This leads to the final idea of creativity to make something with “amazing flavor” while using “cheap ingredients” - “it takes creativity to make something great while being able to get the resources to make it without much trouble.” Other ideas of change and creativity: “felt very professional for making it” “many other people started to love it and remake it in different ways.”

- **Substantial and direct reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** The student skillfully integrates text details with the analysis without using direct quotes “the rules included” “the cheap ingredients ... to feed large families” “pizzeria chains are open across the world”

- **Strong organizational structure** There is an effective introduction which integrates analysis “maybe it was because” with relevant text details to introduce the supporting ideas. These ideas (rules, change, and creativity) are thoroughly developed with text and analysis in the body of the essay and are followed by an adequate conclusion.

- **Skillful use of transitions to link ideas** “Because the people of Naples were so proud” “Maybe it was because” “Since the Neapolitians already made” “The reason why that’s valid” “Because of pizzas” “whatever the reason could’ve been” “Of course” “Nowadays”

- **Effective use of precise language** that uses a variety of transitions between ideas. “with the flatbread being like a canvas” “started gaining fame” “remaking their masterpiece” “that’s valid” “king of all other foods” “one of the greatest and most edible forms of art”

- **Few errors** are present in spelling which do not interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-2 Score 4

Demonstrates effective analysis of text and skillful writing. The student introduces and stays focused on the idea of change throughout the essay, explaining how pizza has changed and evolved as an art through the creativity of cooks, indicating evidence of preplanning by the writer. There is a purposeful, sustained progression throughout the response, effectively connecting student and passage ideas.

- **Effectively addresses all parts of the task** “Pizza is considered the Neapolitan work of art” by linking original ideas about painting and theater with thorough analysis and substantial reference to the text.

- **Thorough and insightful analysis based on explicit and implicit meanings from the text** “The making of pizza has been passed down from generation to generation like how we have old paintings in museums around the world” is connected to the change idea by further analysis “Art couldn’t change until one person decides to do something different. Pizza was the same way, it did not change until “one crafty cook” decided to change it.” There is further analysis linking the ideas of change and creativity - “Theater has also changed culture to culture, from Roman theatre to Greek theatre. These happen because humans have new ideas. How different would art be if the paint tube was not invented, but how different would pizza be if people still thought tomatoes were poisonous?” The effective conclusion stays focused on the task “is their way of showing their creativity” and brings back the idea of changes that had occurred “If canvases had not been made, we would not have paintings” “If the Italians thought cheese would taste bad on it, we would not have pizza” “All this could not have happened if this art of pizza making wasn’t changed.”

- **Substantial and direct reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** There are relevant text examples describing the use of tomatoes and the eventual addition of cheese to effectively support the idea of change. There are also references to the multiple toppings, as well as the change across generations and places.

- **Strong organizational structure and focus on the task** The effective introduction presents the main idea that “pizza has changed from person to person and from place to place” and “has turned into a different kind of pizza and into what we know today.” This is followed by a thorough explanation of how pizza has evolved, with well-explained comparisons to paintings and theater. The conclusion is effective and furthers the analysis linking change to creativity.

- **Skillful use of a variety of transitions to link ideas** “Pizza was the same way” “Theatre has also changed” “These happen because” “How different would art be” “If canvases had not been made” “If the Italians thought cheese would taste bad” “Now we have”

- **Effective use of precise language** “from person to person and from place to place” “from generation to generation” “culture to culture.” Sentence variety is also effectively used to provide transitions between ideas.

- **Few errors are present** in sentence formation, usage, spelling, and capitalization, but do not interfere with meaning.
Demonstrates adequate analysis of text and appropriate writing. The strength of the response is the use of sentence variety to connect ideas. However, the response lacks text support for some ideas, resulting in an explanation that is repetitive rather than thorough. There are missed opportunities for further elaboration that would have clarified the general supporting ideas and resulted in a higher score.

- **Adequately addresses all parts of the task** The first idea “thought of their pizzas as an artwork” is not clear. The second idea is clearly elaborated with text and analysis.

- **Clear analysis based on explicit and implicit meanings from the text.** The analysis of the first idea is less clear, as the student tries to argue whether pizza or art is the greatest invention “people are arguing the same thing.” The second supporting idea is clearer, relating the rules to the “specific procedure when creating a piece of artwork.” There are missed opportunities to make the explanation more specific and thorough. The analytical statements “the specifications made, created, and contributed to the pizza we know and love today” “If the Neapolitans had not been so particular about their pizza, the idea that pizza is a form of art would not have been established” are general and lack specific information that would have clarified why these statements are true.

- **Sufficient and direct reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** The response begins with a brief summary of the text, then uses quotes to correctly support the student’s ideas. There is a missed opportunity to support the statement “the food’s impact on culture could be totally different” using text details which would have clarified the explanation of the first idea.

- **Appropriate organizational structure** A clear introduction sets up the context and introduces the main idea “The masterminds behind the invention thought of their pizzas as an artwork.” This is followed by a developed body which introduces the supporting ideas, using text and analysis for support. There is a loss of focus on task in the confusing argument made in the second paragraph, which ends with the vague statement “the food’s impact on culture could be totally different” which is not explained (what impact? How could it be different?) The writer is more skillful in the third paragraph. The clear conclusion brings back the idea of art as a masterpiece requiring specific rules.

- **Appropriate use of transitions to link ideas** Transitional phrases provide progression throughout the response. “Some people may say” “However, they are one in the same.” “So since pizza is thought” “If the Neapolitans hadn’t considered” “Just as an artist may follow” “As they created” “If the Neapolitans had not been so particular” “While some may argue”

- **Appropriate use of precise language and domain-specific vocabulary** “evolved through the years” “masterminds behind the invention” “rules were assembled to form a certain procedure” “specification made, created, and contributed” “skilled and experienced artist” “creatively invented combination”

- **Few errors are present** in usage and punctuation but do not interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-4 Score 3

Demonstrates adequate analysis of text and appropriate writing. The response addresses the task and develops three supporting ideas with appropriate analysis and text for the first two ideas, while support for the third idea is confusing and repetitive.

- **Adequately addresses all parts of the task** “Pizza is its own form of art.” The response uses mostly clear analysis and sufficient text support to explain ideas.

- **Clear analysis based on explicit and implicit meanings from the text.** The first idea that “they usually do not plan for it to go worldwide” is supported with clear analysis “It usually is an accident. The Neapolitans were not trying to become famous with their pizzas. They were simply trying to feed their families.” The second idea “When making art you follow certain guidelines to get the creation you want” is also supported with clear analysis “The Neapolitans would cook things to a certain point so everything turned out good.” “The Neapolitans were very specific with their pizza making rules. Every art has certain guidelines to follow.”

- **Inconsistent analysis for the third idea** is somewhat confused, caused by the incorrect use of the word random, which is never clearly defined “These ingredients may not have been randomly put together, but the whole concept is random.”

- **Sufficient and direct reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** The response uses appropriate quotes which correctly support each of the three ideas.

- **Appropriate organizational structure and focus on the task.** The clear introduction summarizes passage information to provide context. Ideas are logically grouped “It usually is an accident” “you follow certain guidelines” “Pizza is just another random art.” Each body paragraph ends with a concluding sentence, and the clear conclusion reiterates the ideas presented in the body of the essay. However, the transition from the second idea “art has certain guidelines” to the third idea “Most art is random” is confusing and contradictory.

- **Limited use of transitions to link ideas.** Although the student uses topic sentences and some transitional phrases “When artists are creating their pieces” “With such plentiful and cheap ingredients” “When making a pizza” “When making art” “These ingredients may not have been randomly put together,” transitions between ideas are weak and unclear. While there is progressive thought within paragraphs, the writer has not used transitions to clearly link ideas, and quotes are introduced abruptly.

- **Appropriate use of precise language** “plan for it to go worldwide” “get the creation you want” “certain guidelines to follow”

- **Few errors present** in usage and punctuation do not interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-5 Score 3

**Demonstrates adequate analysis of text and appropriate writing.** The first and third supporting ideas are adequately developed. The development of the second idea is weak, with vague and unsupported statements.

- **Adequately addresses all parts of the task** “which is why it is considered an art form” using mostly clear analysis and sufficient text support to explain ideas.

- **Clear analysis of the first idea** “this is one way a pizza could be considered an art form because of the unique ideas and structure. The word “crafty” was put in the sentence to show that it is not just a cook cooking, but it is an art process of crafty and creative ideas”

**Clear analysis of the third idea** “This spread has brought changes into the pizza creations...With the given information, we can infer that pizza has changed since it’s original form. Therefore it is just as art changes, so it can be considered an art form.”

**Inconsistent analysis of the second idea** “these rules made every ingredient important in the process.” “With every specific detail put into their creations, this could also be a reason it is an art form.” This weak analysis has not explained why art forms require specific details, leaving an unanswered question. It is a missed opportunity for the writer to clarify the explanation.

- **Sufficient and direct reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** Response combines some summary and quotes relevant to student ideas. The quote explaining the use of crushed tomatoes supports the first idea of “unique ideas and structure.” The quote describing the addition of new ingredients correctly supports the third idea “just as art changes.” The second idea of “rules made every ingredient important” is only weakly supported by a quote that relates pride to art form but does not clarify what this has to do with having specific rules.

- **Appropriate organizational structure and focus on the task.** The clear introduction “precise and unique techniques...which is why it is considered an art form” is followed by a body of logically grouped ideas which are mostly adequately developed with text and analysis. The essay maintains focus on the idea of art as something that evolves with the conclusion “New things are added, just as they are to art.”

- **Appropriate use of transitions to link ideas** “First of all” “This is one way” “Second of all” “this could also” “Third of all” “With the given information” “Therefore it is just as art changes” “In conclusion”

- **Appropriate use of precise language** “precise and unique techniques” “The first creations” “art process of crafty and creative ideas” “we can infer” “a structure that can evolve”

- **Few errors are present** in sentence formation, usage, spelling, and punctuation, but do not interfere with meaning
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-6 Score 2

Demonstrates limited analysis of text and inconsistent writing. This response demonstrates some strong writing skills and some clear analysis, but has minimal reference to text details. The first half of the essay is vague, consisting of unsupported statements. The weakness of the response is the lack of direct text support to clarify the explanation. The writer falls short of being able to substantiate what he says. The second half of the essay is stronger, with clearer analysis and examples which support the ideas.

- Inconsistently addresses some parts of the task “pizza as pure art” by explaining vaguely “how the people of Naples felt about pizza” then transitioning to a clearer explanation of how changes occurred and making comparisons to art. The strength of the essay is the analysis on the second page, but a major weakness is the limited reference to relevant details of the text.
- Inconsistent analysis at the beginning of the second paragraph ineffectively and vaguely supports the idea of pizza as art “It wasn’t just a food that you would combine together ingredients... it took time, energy and precies movements to create the masterpiece”. There is clear analysis of the second idea as the writer explains why creating a pizza is like “an artist painting a picture.” “the artist has an exact idea … but along the way they add splashes of colors or streak marks to make it more unique.” These ideas are supported by further analysis linked to a text example “Just as artists add their flair the Italians added a flair of cheese.”
- Limited reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text. The introduction mentions the “bread, cheese, meat filled dish known all over the world and liked by many” but at the beginning of the second paragraph, there are missed opportunities to add text examples which would support the writer’s statements, resulting in unanswered questions (what ingredients would you combine? What time and energy and movements did it take?). On the second page, the direct text reference to support the “flair of cheese” ties the student ideas about art to a text idea, the change “from traditional ways.”
- Weak organizational structure begins with an adequate introduction. However, the transition from the introduction to the body of the essay is abrupt, using a quote instead of a student idea. This is followed by a list of unsupported statements, followed by clearer development on the second page. The conclusion is adequate, linking student ideas “may not hang up on walls or be sold for millions” back to the idea of a “masterpiece” and art form.
- Some appropriate use of transitions to link ideas “the way ...now a days” “but the way the Neapolitans” “At first” “but along the way” “Just as” “So yes”, but overall, the student did not include sufficient text information to consistently demonstrate his skill at linking his ideas with those from the passage.
- Appropriate use of precise language “mouth watering taste” “How the crust crunches” “the masterpiece that is pizza” “splashes of colors” “flair of cheese” “sold for millions”
- Some errors are present in usage, spelling, and punctuation but seldom interfere with meaning.
Itlay’s Greatest Gift  A-7 Score 2

Demonstrates limited analysis of text and inconsistent writing. Each of the three ideas presented in the second paragraph should have been developed and elaborated with further analysis and specific text support.

- **Inconsistently addresses some parts of the task** The student provides three reasons that pizza is an art form representing “their artistic ways,” but these reasons need to be further explained with a combination of text details and analysis.

- **Inconsistent analysis** There are weak comparisons “putting tomato paste on flat bread is like coloring...or painting” “adding different toppings on the pizza it was like painting a different picture” “When it spread over to the Americans...it was like selling art out across the world.” Each of these ideas needs to be expanded to a paragraph with text and analysis to explain why these comparisons are valid. Without that explanation, the reader of the essay has to do the work of making the connections based on his own knowledge.

- **Limited and/or vague reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** “tomato paste on flat bread” “adding different toppings” “spread over to the Americans”. These references represent missed opportunities to add text details or analysis to clarify these statements. The reader of the essay cannot understand what these statements mean without having read the passage.

- **Weak organizational structure** The response begins with a weak introduction which restates the task, then presents the idea that pizza is an art form because of how it is made. The body of the essay is weakly developed and is followed by a weak conclusion which repeats what was already stated in the essay.

- **Limited use of transitions to link ideas** “So they” “When they started” “When it spread” “After all” but it is not clear how the ideas in the second paragraph are connected to each other.

- **Inconsistent use of precise language** “known for their artistic ways”

- **Errors** in sentence formation, usage, spelling, and punctuation seldom interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-8 Score 2

**Demonstrates limited analysis of text and inconsistent writing.** The student’s attempt to present, organize, and support three ideas as to why pizza is an art form barely raises this response above the “1” level. Most of the content of the response consists of text summary.

- **Inconsistently addresses the task** of explaining why pizza is a form of art by presenting three ideas and attempts to support them with text, but lacks further analysis to clarify the ideas.
- **Inconsistent analysis** consists of three supporting ideas “because they harvest everything themselves” “they make everything from scratch” “they made it and created it on their own.” There is one unsuccessful attempt to extend the last idea “soon a recipe was developed, but people still twist the recipe.” But this vague statement is unexplained.
- **Limited reference to the text.** Supporting information is summarized and repetitive, with references to harvest and dough handling.
- **Weak organizational structure** There is a weak introduction which presents the three supporting ideas. Grouping of these ideas within the body of the essay is ineffective as harvesting and dough handling are discussed in both paragraphs two and three. The conclusion is also weak, repeating the information already provided in the introduction.
- **Limited use of simplistic transitions** to link ideas “One reason” “Secondly” “Lastly”, but there are no transitions connecting ideas to the text support that follows in each paragraph.
- **Inconsistent use of precise language** “everything from scratch” “recipe was developed”
- **Few conventions errors** are present, but most of the response consists of text language. The student has not attempted complex sentences or precise vocabulary to demonstrate a thorough grasp of conventions.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-9 Score 1

Demonstrates minimal analysis of text and inadequate writing. The response consists of a list of randomly ordered statements with a minimal attempt at analysis.

- Minimally addresses part of the task “How Italian pizza can be considered as an art form” by giving a characteristic of art and explaining how that applies to pizza.
- Minimal attempt at analysis The student presents an original idea “An art is something that was created and became historic or famous.” However, the idea is not supported with further analysis to explain what that statement means or why the idea is valid.
- Minimal reference to the passage consists of a summary of information from the text.
- Minimal evidence of an organizational structure. The student attempts a minimal introduction with a rhetorical question and follows it with a list of randomly ordered statements. All of these statements could be reordered without affecting the meaning of the response. The student attempts a concluding sentence which introduces a new idea “that pizza is an art because people all over the world eat an love pizza.”
- There are no transitions to link ideas.
- Little or no use of precise language.
- Errors in sentence formation, usage, spelling, capitalization, and punctuation seldom interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-10 Score 1

Demonstrates minimal analysis of text and inadequate writing. The response is a summary of text information with no evidence of analysis or original thought. While the information presented is relevant to the topic of pizza and demonstrates awareness of the task “some classify it as a type of art,” the student has not explained why he has chosen to give us all of this passage information.

- **Minimally addresses part of the task** “some classify it as a type of art” by showing the reader some of the facts from the passage.
- **There is no analysis** although there are inferences made concerning the changing popularity of pizza.
- **Minimal reference to the passage** consists of a summary of information from the text.
- **Minimal evidence of an organizational structure** as the student attempts to introduce “The popular food we all know and love.” The organizational structure follows the chronology of events as presented in the text.
- **Transitions are used** only to move the reader through the chronology, giving some indication of the passage of time “At first” “As the years dragged by” “By this time” but are not used to link ideas.
- **Inconsistent use of precise language** “we all know and love” “majority of its popularity” “marks its spot in Americans hearts”
- **Errors in** usage, spelling, and punctuation seldom interfere with meaning.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-11 Score 1

**Demonstrates minimal analysis of text and inadequate writing.** The student presents an original idea that “it looks like a sculpture or a painting to them” and attempts to support this with a statement about how pizza has changed providing a text example. This response is barely minimal. If the text detail “flatbread herbs, oil and spices” had not been included, the response would be insufficient. If the student’s idea “it looks like a sculpture or a painting” had not been included, the response would be insufficient.

- **Minimally addresses part of the task** “pizza is a art” by attempting to explain the change in how pizza looks and relate it to other art forms.
- **Minimal attempt at analysis** “it looks like a sculpture or a painting to them”
- **Minimal reference to the main ideas and relevant details of the text** “does not look the same today. Pizza used to have flatbread herbs, oil and spices.”
- **Minimal evidence of an organizational structure** with an introductory sentence that restates the task, followed by a list of disconnected but related ideas. Instead of continuing the development of the idea of how pizza looks different now or clarifying how these ideas are connected, the response ends with a new idea. There is no conclusion.
- **The response lacks transitions** to link ideas.
- **Little or no use of precise language.**
- **Errors in** sentence formation, usage, spelling, and capitalization may interfere with meaning.
The response addresses part of the question but contains no information indicating that the student read and understood the text. There are no references to the passage to indicate that any of the ideas presented “the way you cook it, the way you design it, and the way you eat it” are based on understanding of text information rather than the student’s own general knowledge. The response provides insufficient information from the passage, and therefore, does not minimally address the task. A response that does not use text information for support and is written completely from the task and a student’s own knowledge is insufficient to be assessed by the criteria on the rubric.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-13 Insufficient
The response addresses part of the question but contains no information indicating that the student read and understood the text. The explanations of why pizza is an art form “what it expressed was happiness” and “all one of a kind artworks” are from the student’s own knowledge. While the conclusion “thought it was something special” is vaguely related to a text idea, the response provides insufficient information from the passage, and therefore, does not minimally address the task. A response that does not use text information for support and is written completely from the task and a student’s own knowledge is insufficient to be assessed by the criteria on the rubric.
Italy’s Greatest Gift  A-14 Insufficient
The student attempts to respond to the task, and the information presented is correct and related to text ideas “the italians made their pizza with extreme care” and “You can also create pizzas in many different ways.” However, the response is too brief and is insufficient to be assessed by the criteria on the rubric.