

MINUTES

State Board of Education Meeting

Date

Tuesday, March 8, 2022

Time

1:00 p.m.

Location

Rutledge Conference Center
1429 Senate Street
Columbia, SC 29201

Alan Walters., Chair
Crystal Stapleton, Chair-Elect
Molly M. Spearman, State Superintendent of Education,
Secretary and Administrative Officer to the Board

If you require Section 504 or ADA accommodations to attend or participate in this public meeting, please contact Tracy Moore.

Notice: Due to allergies of staff and visitors, we ask that visitors refrain from wearing scented products when attending the State Board of Education meetings in SCDE facilities.

SBE Mission: The State Board of Education's mission is to provide a leadership role in helping South Carolina set policy and direction to transform teaching and learning so that students are prepared with the necessary knowledge and skills, including innovation, to compete globally and live a productive life.

The following State Board of Education (SBE) members physically attended: Chair Alan Walters, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit; Chair-Elect Crystal Stapleton, Second Judicial Circuit; Delaney K. Frierson, Third Judicial Circuit; Cathy D. Chapman, Fourth Judicial Circuit; Carl Hinze, Seventh Judicial Circuit; Cynthia A. Downs, Ed.D., Eighth Judicial Circuit; Larry Kobrovsky, Ninth Judicial Circuit; Sallie R. Lee, Tenth Judicial Circuit; Cheryl Collier, Thirteenth Judicial Circuit; Mary Cordray, Fourteenth Judicial Circuit; Kristi Woodall, Sixteenth Judicial Circuit; and Michael Brenan, Governor's Appointee. Newly appointed members, Joyce Crimminger, Sixth Judicial Circuit and Dr. David O'Shields, Eighth Judicial Circuit, attended the meeting for the first time.

The following South Carolina Department of Education (SCDE) staff were physically attending: Molly Spearman, State Superintendent of Education; Cathy Hazelwood, Deputy Superintendent, General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division of Legal Affairs; Barbara A. Drayton, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division of Legal Affairs; Katie Nilges, Director, Office of Governmental Affairs, Division of Legal Affairs; Tracy Moore, SBE Minutes Taker/Administrative Coordinator, Office of General Counsel, Division of Legal Affairs; Kenzie

Riddle, Program Manager, Office of Governmental Affairs, Division of Legal Affairs; Frances “Cricket” Katsos, Administrative Coordinator, Office of Governmental Affairs, Division of Legal Affairs; Betsy Carpenter, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; David Mathis, Ed.D., Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness; Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Office of Finance; Derek Phillips, Public Information Director, Office of Communications; Travis Huggins, Information Technology Manager I, Chief Information Office, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Rashard Huntley, IT Specialist II, Chief Information Office, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Quinn Murphy, IT Specialist III, Chief Information Office, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; and Raymond Dues, IT Specialist III, Chief Information Office, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations.

I. WELCOME/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The SBE meeting convened at 1:01 p.m. Chair Walters called the meeting to order and welcomed everyone who attended either physically or virtually.

Chair-Elect Stapleton led everyone in the Pledge of Allegiance. (Due to the pandemic, all JROTC performances are discontinued until further notice.)

II. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 8, 2022

Chair Walters asked if there were any objections to approving the minutes as presented for the SBE meeting on February 8, 2022. Hearing no objections, the minutes were approved by unanimous consent.

III. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AGENDA FOR MARCH 8, 2022

Chair Walters asked if there were any objections to approving the agenda as presented for the March 8, 2022, SBE meeting. Hearing no objections, the agenda was approved by unanimous consent.

IV. RECOGNITION OF VISITORS AND NEWS MEDIA

Chair Walters welcomed any media and asked if any had signed in. He welcomed Lisa Manning, Kershaw Teacher of the Year, a 5th grade teacher at Dobies Mill Elementary, on behalf of the Kershaw County Leadership Council. Twelve of the leadership council members attended, a stop on their way to a meeting at the State House.

V. STATE BOARD CHAIR REPORT

Chair Walters introduced new Board Members Dr. David O'Shields and Ms. Joyce Crimminger. Dr. O'Shields is the current Superintendent of Laurens School District 56. Ms. Crimminger is a retired English teacher after 42 years, and current substitute teacher. Mr. Walters announced Dr. Downs final meeting as a Board Member and thanked her for her service to the Board.

Chair Walters reported that he attended the Education Leaders Experience, a leadership development conference on February 15th. He also attended ETV's School Safety Panel Discussion.

VI. STATE SUPERINTENDENT OF EDUCATION REPORT

Superintendent Spearman thanked Dr. Downs for her service to the Board and welcomed new board members, Dr. David O'Shields and Ms. Joyce Crimminger.

The Superintendent reported a new partnership with the South Carolina Technical College system, sharing a portion of ESSER funds with the technical college system, in the amount of 11.5 million dollars over a three-year period, in an effort to expand our CTE, career technology programs, our adult education programs, and provide scholarships to high-demand technical college across the state.

Superintendent Spearman congratulated Dr. Stephanie DiStasio and her team for building the beautiful 23-page Education Flexibility Guide. The Guide provides a step-by-step overview of current flexibilities that exist in state law for district and school leaders to develop personalized flexibilities learning in their schools and in their school districts. She reported that training webinars have taken place with district employees across the state and discussions are taking place relating to providing the training for school board members.

The Superintendent announced a partnership with Children's Trust of South Carolina. All school districts are eligible to send representatives to a nationally established training on adverse childhood experiences (ACEs) A train-the-trainer model will allow our educators to recognize the impacts of the pandemic and how to support the mental health of our students and our teachers. She reported that the SCDE is very excited about working with this wonderful organization.

Superintendent Spearman reported on the 2022 Schools to Watch, recognizing outstanding leadership and outstanding middle schools. She had the honor previously of assisting in the announcements of these awards across the state, and also our principal leadership awards. The Superintendent met a young man in Indian Land at the time, Indian Land Middle School, our South Carolina Middle School Principal of the Year. He has done wonderful things and continues to move up the ladder. Dr. David McDonald. David serves as the Assistant Superintendent of

school leadership and director of middle schools in Greenville County and will provide you a little more detail about the Schools to Watch program.

Dr. McDonald thanked the Superintendent for the invitation to be here today. He shared his delight to be able to share these schools and the hard work that they have done, not just this year but for many years to become part of the Schools to Watch group. There are 29 schools in South Carolina that have earned this designation. Dr. McDonald noted that the very first School to Watch in South Carolina has been designated as part of this announcement. "These schools have made a commitment to be academically excellent, developmentally responsive, socially equitable, and to have great organizational structures in place to support student learning. They are welcoming, they are inviting. They love their kids. They take care of their staff, and they create environments where kids can, and they do learn. Each of these schools are so unique and they are so similar. All in the same package. As a volunteer team, I am able to visit these schools, to see the great things they're doing and then recognize them. They become part of a group across the country. Right now, there are 19 states that participate in Schools to Watch. And there are just over 500 schools that have earned this designation. So, it's a big deal when 29 of those are right here in South Carolina. The seven schools that we recognize today, four of them have been at this for a while. Lugoff-Elgin is our longest running School to Watch, Lugoff-Elgin has been doing this for 15 years. This isn't just an award where they get a banner and a plaque. I think they would all share that they have to constantly work at this. They're setting goals and constantly revisiting and revising those goals. They are constantly looking at ways that they can become better. Every three years, we go back, and we visit these schools again. Our hope is that they continue to be a School to Watch for a very long time, that they won't ever fall on the list of schools not to watch anymore. Because we want them to be highly successful. Mrs. Crimminger and I had the opportunity of working together in Lancaster County, where we were both Schools to Watch principals. And it is truly an honor to be able to share these schools with you. And thank you, Superintendent Spearman, for inviting us to be a part of today."

Superintendent Spearman announced the Principals who attended on behalf of their respective schools.

1. Leslie M. Stover Middle School (Kershaw), Principal – Chantelle Baker Zimmer
2. Phinnize J. Fisher Middle School (Greenville), Principal – Jeremie Smith
3. Northwood Middle School (Greenville), Principal – Treva Lee
4. Lugoff-Elgin Middle School (Kershaw), Principal – Gene Cameron
5. Dutchman Creek Middle School (Rock Hill), Principal – Clayton Moton
6. Springfield Middle School (Fort Mill), Principal – Keith Griffin
7. Camden Middle School (Kershaw), Principal – Byron Johnson

Superintendent Spearman concluded with, "We all are in awe of what our principals have done because you are the caretakers of your school, your community, your teachers, through the

pandemic, and often the caretakers have the most burden on them. So, thank you for what you all have done. You set the tone for the entire school. So, congratulations to you, congratulations.”

VII. PARLEMENTARIAN COMMENT

Chair Walters recognized Cathy Hazelwood, Parliamentarian. Ms. Hazelwood reported that Nancy Williams, our Chief Financial Officer (CFO) will provide an update on your budget, and she shared a bit of financial information prior to the report. The Department has expended \$13,106 on teacher cases this far into the current fiscal year. Board members should be aware of how many cases in full ELC and ELC have been presented by the Office of General Counsel. She touched on the media reporting teachers leaving and that it is a significant amount of money for the Department.

Ms. Hazelwood informed the Board that the SCDE has issued a fiscal watch to Lancaster, and they have appealed. Under the timeline provided for in the statute, when that designation is made, the Board is required to hear this case by the April 12th meeting. This is an appellant hearing. You will be provided the documents prior to the hearing, and it will be heard at the conclusion of the full State Board meeting. Without knowing what the agenda will look like for April yet, tentatively 2:30 p.m. will be the starting time for the hearing.

Ms. Hazelwood reported that new members need to file their statement of economic interest for this year prior to March 30th and directions will be emailed to those members after today's meeting.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

IX. STATE BOARD ITEMS

PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Did not meet.

EP EDUCATOR PROFESSIONS—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Walters recognized Ms. Lee, who reported that the sub-committee met and heard three action item(s) and three item(s) for information. The action items were placed on the Consent Agenda.

This concluded Ms. Lee's report.

FOR APPROVAL

- 01.** Critical Need Subjects and Schools for Employment of Retired Educators: 2022-23
- 02.** Professional Review Committee (PRC): New Member Approval
- 03.** South Carolina Educator Preparation Guidelines: Standards, Policies, and Procedures Annual Reporting Requirements

FOR INFORMATION

- 04.** Annual Report on Individuals Certified through the American Board for the Certification of Teacher Excellence (American Board)
- 05.** Annual Report on Individuals Certified through Teachers of Tomorrow
- 06.** Report on Individuals Certified through the South Carolina Teach for America Program 2020-21

SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Walters recognized Ms. Frierson, who reported that the sub-committee met and heard three action item(s) and no item(s) for information. The action items were placed on the Consent Agenda.

This concluded Ms. Frierson's report.

FOR APPROVAL

- 01.** American Sign Language Standards approval
- 02.** Adoption of Social Studies Instructional Materials
- 03.** Appointment Recommendations for the 2022 Instructional Materials Review Panels

Chair Walters recognized Mr. Kobrovsky for comment. Mr. Kobrovsky thanked the chair and the committee chair, Mrs. Frierson, for the excellent way she ran the committee. It was open and allowed everybody to speak. He also thanked Superintendent Spearman and Dr. Mathis for the deliberate and considerate way that they've allowed the process for textbooks to go through. He thinks they have done an excellent job, being thorough and vetting everything. Mr. Kobrovsky expressed appreciation for the extension of time that was given and wanted to voice why he objected on the one very narrow point for the consent for the appointees for European history, advanced placement, and Western civilization." We're now at a time when that's in doubt. As we are all meeting here, in the Ukraine, people are dying by the thousands for

Western civilization in *European history*.” Mr. Kobrovsky did not feel he adequately knew who the people were in that committee to allow him to know if there was a diversity of intellectual thought. *He feels as though the materials for review, as Dr. Mathis has found, had things that were objectionable or questionable. “For instance, in American government, it had in there that in the United States all people are entitled the equal protection under the law, political equality.* This is not the same as economic equality. The capital system in the United States enables some to achieve greater financial achievements than others. However, other economic systems such as socialism and communism do seek to distribute wealth more evenly across society.” Mr. Kobrovsky commended everyone for finding that and asking for edits. He stated this is why he felt he “could not vote for those appointees, given his limited knowledge of the members and objections to certain things in the material. But again, I commend you for your tireless dedication to the job of reviewing these materials for approval. He thanked the chair and the committee.”

ELC EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Walters recognized Ms. Chapman who reported the sub-committee met and took action upon the following twelve cases; eleven suspensions and one public reprimand. Ms. Chapman further reported that these matters were ratified during the Full Board ELC meeting.

FB-ELC FULL BOARD EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Walters reported that the Full Board ELC met and took action upon the following three cases; one initial application approval, one suspension and one permanent revocation. He further confirmed that the Full Board ELC ratified the work of the ELC.

IX. CONSENT AGENDA

All Committee Items presented to the State Board for approval by motion make up the Consent Agenda. Dr. Downs made the motion to approve the Consent Agenda. Chair-Elect Stapleton seconded the motion. The motion passed by unanimous consent, with Mr. Kobrovsky’s objections previously noted.

X. SOUTH CAROLINA BOARD OF EDUCATION REPORT

01. Literacy Update—David Mathis, EdD, Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness

Dr. Mathis reported that districts are required to administer interim assessments three times per year: fall, winter, and spring. The approved interim assessments are NWEA: MAP, Renaissance: Star, and Curriculum Associates: iReady.

Education Analytics is assisting South Carolina in analyzing our state interim data which includes both current and historical data. The latest analysis indicates the following:

- Between spring 2021 and fall 2021, there is evidence of learning recovery in both ELA and Math.
- However, students' learning still lags behind pre-COVID learning rates by about 1.8 months in ELA and 2.1 months in math.
- This means that things are moving in the right direction, but we still have more work to do before students are "caught up."
- There is more learning lag (as of fall 2021) for students who are economically disadvantaged, minority, and who have low prior achievement (in ELA only for this last category).
- We generally see more equity gaps in ELA than we do in math; in other words, even though overall, learning lag is worse in Math than in ELA, there are larger gaps between student groups in ELA in ways that would exacerbate pre-COVID opportunity gaps.

When analyzing the data, it is important to note the impact of quarantine and isolations this year.

- Total Staff Isolated Since Start of 2021-2022 School Year: 21,652
- Total Students Isolated Since Start of 2021-2022 School Year: 121,705
- Total Staff Quarantined Since Start of 2021-2022 School Year: 14,164
- Total Students Quarantined Since Start of 2021-2022 School Year: 422,414
 - Isolation is required when an individual tests positive for COVID-19 and quarantine is required when an unvaccinated individual is a close contact of someone who has tested positive.

Districts need time to analyze their data and compare results to state results. While reviewing data, districts should carefully and cautiously examine the impact of intervention strategies implemented to address the learning lag. As districts analyze data, a focus should be on valuating the impact of tier one, core instruction provided to all students and the interventions in place for students who are below grade level. Further, with the analysis after spring '22 assessment data, we can determine where recovery is the strongest and determine what strategies those districts and schools have been using.

02. Quarterly Review of State Board of Education's Fiscal Year 2021–22 Budget—Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Office of Finance

Good afternoon, Mr. Chair, and members of the board, I'm going to provide a very brief overview of your budget, as of February 28th, 2022. It's not right at a quarter. As you may recall, this fiscal year, the general assembly increased the budget for the State Board from \$58,034 to \$258,034. And that's reflected in that current budget column of the first page of this report. Remember your budget is broken down into two components. So, the first component is for state operations and salary. And the second component relates to the portion that assists with teacher cases. So, after we budget for salary and employer contributions related to those new positions appropriated this year, \$76,034 remain. Of that amount, \$32,000 relates to the

teacher cases component and \$44,034 is what's available for operations like travel and web conferencing software and things of that nature. As of February 28th, 2022, the year-to-date actual expense column of the report shows that \$42,869 has been expended. And again, that's primarily on travel related costs over the past two years. And I know it's because of the pandemic, your operational expenditures have averaged about \$1,600 a month. The second and third page of the report, which show the actual details of the expenditures as Ms. Hazelwood said earlier, there are about \$13,000 related to teacher cases that we have not transferred to the educator complaint portion of your budget, but we will do so. We will continue to monitor your budget as we go and make transfers as necessary. This concluded Ms. Williams' report. Chair Walters thanked Ms. Williams and asked if there were any questions.

03. Allendale County School District (ASCD) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

Ms. Mack reported that on February 24th the Allendale County School District and Dr. Gilmore hosted a town hall meeting to present and answer questions about the proposed 2022-23 modified calendar. An in-person, community meeting was held on Monday, February 28th, and most of their meetings have been virtual. This is a new, great development for them. Allendale County School District continues to hold vaccine clinics.

04. Florence County School District Four (FCSD-4) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

In Florence School District 4, COVID testing is offered in the district on Tuesdays and Thursdays; our fourth and fifth grade students collaborated with the middle and high school students to host a Black History Wax Museum for the district; and all the Brockington Elementary students who made an A in math, were treated to a dinner at our local restaurant by the math interventionist.

05. Williamsburg County School District (WCSD) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

In Williamsburg County School District, the curriculum and instruction department are currently providing professional development to all teachers with a focus on collective responsibility and student engagement; the Sumter Touchdown Club named a Kingstree high school student as Scholar Athlete of the Year; and four Kingstree players were named to the all-area team with one of them being named Lineman of the Year.

This concluded Ms. Mack's report.

06. Legislative Update — Kenzie Riddle, Office of Governmental Affairs, Division of Legal Affairs
Mr. Chairman and members, thank you for having me. I look forward to getting to know each of you better. I will also be brief as you can see, I'm the last person on the agenda, so I know you are ready to go. The legislature just started in January, but no bills have really made it all the way through the process. The Ways and Means process budget week is actually next week. Some of the main items include:

- Structural materials, a hundred million in non-recurring dollars;
- Capital funding for disadvantaged schools, 150 million;
- Bus driver salary increases of 5 percent, 4.2 million;
- Virtual SC, 5 million with 20 new Full Time Employees (the FTEs would be your new teachers for virtual SC);
- Teacher supplies, 2 million. Currently the teachers are getting \$275, This bumps it up to \$300; and
- Grants committee, 12 million.

One of the bigger topics is that there will be no base in cost anymore with the proposed new funding formula. I will send you the packet that RFA did after this meeting. Nancy, Katie, myself, and Superintendent Spearman are still looking at it and trying to understand it. But with the formula, ways and means put in \$226 million. This increases every teacher's salary by \$4,000. The new teachers will get \$40,000 as opposed to \$36,000, which is their starting salary currently. That is all budget wise in legislation.

Katie and I have been following several bills. Some of the more visible ones you will hear about is the education savings account. There are two different bills. The house has a bill, and the Senate has a bill. And then obviously the critical race theory stuff, which they're having another meeting at 2:30 p.m. We will keep you posted on those bills along with several other ones. This concluded Ms. Riddle's report.

Chair-Elect Stapleton asked what the percent increase for bus drivers would take them to. Ms. Riddle responded that the legislation currently provides for \$8.44 cents. So, this bumps them up to a whopping \$8.86 cents. Chair Walters responded that most districts pay substantially more than that. Ms. Riddle replied that most districts pay up to about \$15 an hour, but the state covers that \$8.86 portion.

Chair Walters recognized Superintendent Spearman. She thanked Ms. Riddle for the report. The Superintendent commented that we are very grateful for the funding that Ways and Means has given us, in almost everything we ask for. Not quite everything, but the big-ticket items for sure. We had requested some 260 odd million for a two percent teacher raise the Governor's Office proposed and Ways and Means went with funding it a bit differently; to this \$40,000 base pay

plus a \$4,000 for each scale of the salary schedule, which is in all in the new funding model. A lot of changes, and there are still a lot of questions. Their goal is to simplify the process, I think, and to equalize so that all of us understand the funding system, but there are a number of questions. This was reported to the superintendents last Thursday, the first time that we all had seen the actual numbers and more detail about how the formula works. There are a lot of questions, and we will be working with the legislature. We have a great expert that we rely on, Nancy Williams, and hope that the districts rely even more, asking her questions about how this really plays out. The biggest concern we have heard from superintendents, is if there is really enough there to give every teacher a \$4,000 raise. That is the legislative intent, but we are checking very closely to make sure that that is reality, as it is the biggest percentage of a local budget. That puts a tremendous demand and burden if it's not funded adequately from the state. Just know that we're watching that.

Superintendent Spearman reports being thrilled about the hundred million for instructional materials. She further reported they are working on the bus lease, which we changed to a lease purchase program during my tenure. She appreciates legislative support there. Superintendent Spearman reports being thrilled with the funding for struggling districts, our rural districts, in their facility money. The legislature funded a hundred million last year and the house now has proposed 150 million for next year. We will be announcing very soon the results of our development of a formula on how that funding would be distributed to the neediest districts with the neediest facilities and programs. We are really trying to get it to those areas that just absolutely do not have the tax base to build their own buildings. They could raise the tax mil to a hundred mils or 300 mils and still will not get enough money to build a building. I believe that the state has a huge responsibility to help, and the legislature is coming through on that. We are trying to be very prudent with the funding that we have been given, but you should hear some announcements on distribution. We're excited and hope that this amount goes through at 200 million. That would be fantastic. I'll be happy to answer any other questions you all might have.

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Chair Walters recognized Superintendent Spearman for other business. "Mr. Chair, it's kind of a bittersweet day and week for all of us here at the Department. We are happy for one of our deputies, who's gotten an extraordinary opportunity to move to a new area. John Payne came to the Department over 15 years ago as an education associate. He thought it was just for a couple months. He was extraordinary and has been in every role that he has had here at the Department. Most of his work has been in special education, serving our children and teachers in that area. A lot of creative things that he has helped to do in that side of our work. He became a director and for the last few years has served as a Deputy Superintendent, and as we have evolved in our reorganization, he's always been willing.

He's the type of person you can tell him about a problem and he's going to think of a solution and get it done. John is going to work with the South Carolina Public Charter District. This is his final appearance before the Board. We are going to miss you so much, but so happy for the great opportunity. I know you all join me in thanking John for the extraordinary work he's done here at the Department of Education."

Chair Walters responded, "On behalf of the board, we'd like to express our appreciation for all that you've done, and we look forward to your new opportunity."

Chair Walters then reported that the proposed amendment to Regulation 43-300 is being withdrawn.

Chair Walters reminded the Board Members that photos would be taken upon adjournment of the Board meeting.

Chair Walters reminded all members to turn in their travel forms prior to their departure.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the SBE adjourned at 1:48 p.m.