

**MEETING MINUTES**  
**State Board of Education Meeting**

**DATE**  
**Tuesday, February 9, 2021**

**TIME**  
**12:00 p.m.**

**LOCATION**  
**Rutledge Conference Center**  
**1429 Senate Street**  
**Columbia, SC 29201**

*Kristi Woodall, Ed.D., Chair*  
*Alan Walters, Chair-Elect*  
*Molly M. Spearman, State Superintendent of Education,*  
*Secretary and Administrative Officer to the Board*

**If you require Section 504 or ADA accommodations to attend or participate in this public meeting, please contact [Noelle Redd](#).**

**Notice: Due to allergies of staff and visitors, we ask that visitors refrain from wearing scented products when attending the State Board of Education meetings in SCDE facilities.**

*SBE Mission: The State Board of Education's mission is to provide a leadership role in helping South Carolina set policy and direction to transform teaching and learning so that students are prepared with the necessary knowledge and skills, including innovation, to compete globally and live a productive life.*

In addition to Chair Woodall, the following SBE members were also physically attending Chair-Elect Alan Walters, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit; Crystal Stapleton, Second Judicial Circuit; Cathy D. Chapman, Fourth Judicial Circuit; Sallie R. Lee, Tenth Judicial Circuit; Steven English, Eleventh Judicial Circuit; and Michael Brenan, the Governor's Appointee.

Members attending virtually were Jon Butzon, First Judicial Circuit; Dr. Tracy West, Fifth Judicial Circuit; Dr. J.R. Green, Sixth Judicial Circuit; Carl Hinze, Seventh Judicial Circuit; Cynthia A. Downs, Ed.D., Eighth Judicial Circuit; Larry Kobrovsky, Ninth Judicial Circuit; Jean W. Pearson, Twelfth Judicial Circuit; David Whittemore, Thirteenth Judicial Circuit; and Valaree C. Smith, Fourteenth Judicial Circuit.

The following South Carolina Department of Education (SCDE) staff were physically attending: Molly Spearman, State Superintendent of Education; Noelle Redd, Minutes Taker, Division for Legal Affairs; Cathy Hazelwood, Deputy Superintendent and Parliamentarian, Division for Legal Affairs; Ryan Brown, Chief Communications Officer; Barbara A. Drayton, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Holly M. Hadden, Assistant General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Steven Strother, Finance Director, Office of Finance; Travis Huggins, Information Technology Manager I, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Lewis Chambers, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; and Alexandra Robinson, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations.

SCDE staff attending virtually were: Betsy Carpentier, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Karla Hawkins, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; David Mathis, Ed.D., Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness; John Payne, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Financial Office; Mary Hipp, Director, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; Carla Edwards, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; Sarah Longshore, Director, State Accountability, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; and Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement.

|                                        |
|----------------------------------------|
| <b>I. WELCOME/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE</b> |
|----------------------------------------|

The State Board of Education (SBE) meeting convened at 12:20 p.m. Chair Woodall called the meeting to order. Chair Woodall welcomed everyone who attended either physically or virtually.

Chair-Elect Walters led everyone in the Pledge of Allegiance. (Due to the pandemic, all JROTC performances are discontinued until further notice.)

|                                                                                  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>II. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES FOR<br/>JANUARY 12, 2021</b> |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

Chair Woodall asked if there were any objections to approving the minutes as presented for the SBE meeting on January 12, 2021. Hearing no objections, the minutes were approved by unanimous consent.

### **III. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AGENDA FOR FEBRUARY 9, 2021**

Chair Woodall asked if there were any objections to approving the agenda as presented for the February 9, 2021, SBE meeting. Hearing no objections, the agenda was approved by unanimous consent.

### **IV. RECOGNITION OF VISITORS AND NEWS MEDIA**

No visitors or media were present.

### **V. STATE BOARD CHAIR REPORT**

Chair Woodall recognized and welcomed Sallie R. Lee, the SBE's newest member. Mrs. Lee replaced Mrs. Debby Howard as the representative for the Tenth Judicial Circuit.

Chair Woodall stated that Mrs. Lee is a former elementary classroom teacher and school guidance counselor. Mrs. Lee resigned to care for their young children, and during that time, she ran for a special election to the Anderson School District 1 Board of Trustees. When that term ended, Mrs. Lee ran and was re-elected to two additional terms and served over ten years as a school trustee. Technically, Mrs. Lee never retired; she just served in various capacities in education. Her husband's career has taken her family to different states over the years, but they always keep their home base in upstate SC.

This concluded Chair Woodall's report.

### **VI. STATE SUPERINTENDENT OF EDUCATION REPORT**

Superintendent Spearman welcomed everyone who attended today's meeting either physically or virtually. She began her report by congratulating Alex Blocker of Irmo High School (Lexington/Richland School District Five) and Hamilton Sprawls of South Florence High School (Florence County School District One) who were chosen as SC's two delegates to the 59th United States Senate Youth Program. Each received a \$10,000 scholarship. Due to the pandemic, the Washington DC tour will be a virtual tour.

Superintendent Spearman also congratulated Principal Henry Darby from North Charleston High School (Charleston County School District) who, on February 8, 2021, was awarded the Order of the Palmetto by Governor Henry McMaster. Principal Darby has also received national recognition for taking on a nightshift position at Walmart to financially assist his students and district families in need. His story has been picked up by local and national news and morning shows. Superintendent Spearman stated that she plans to have Principal Darby virtually attend a

future SBE meeting.

Superintendent Spearman gave a current update on the methods of instruction for all students

- 646 schools—full face-to-face (f2f)
- 589 schools—hybrid (2–4 days per week)
- 31 schools—fully virtual (all schools in Lee and Calhoun, although, Calhoun announced they would begin going back in the classroom next week)

She stated these numbers change daily because of staffing issues. She is still pushing for a return to full f2f instruction. The data shows that the infection rate is very low in a school setting. All of the mitigation processes are working and schools can operate safely.

Superintendent Spearman stated that later today, there would be a report from Education Analytics (EA) showing that our children have suffered and are continuing to suffer because of the pandemic. There are areas where they have grown and other areas where they are failing. The data clearly shows that virtual students are not doing as well as those students receiving f2f learning, and even some of the f2f children are a few months behind. EA is working with districts and putting together plans on how to put together programs of instruction to bring our students back to where they should be had the pandemic not occurred. We have learned that our summer camps should not be just reading camps, they need to be reading and math camps. We need to beef up our reading programs, after looking at the data; we did not get the bang for our bucks, in growth that we should have gotten. We are looking at why our reading programs did not work. We are looking at some stronger and different programs. Unfortunately, some of our readers made no advancement in their reading growth while attending the summer program. You will receive more information later at today's meeting, but please know that we are working with our districts to help them develop their plans.

Superintendent Spearman provided a current update on the COVID-19 vaccine distribution stating that

- the state was currently in Phase 1A – healthcare workers, 65+, and long term care facilities, school nurses, a few educators, and school speech pathologists;
- educators and support staff are currently in Phase 1B
  - 122,876 educators and staff eligible in SC public schools,
  - 70,973 (58%) indicate they will take the COVID-19 vaccine when offered to them, and
  - the SCDE has worked to match each district with an approved vaccine provider;
- a Joint Resolution is being debated in the Senate that would require full vaccination of educators and staff by March 22nd and a return to full f2f instruction within two weeks; and
  - Superintendent Spearman spoke in support of this bill on February 4, 2021.

Superintendent Spearman wrote a letter to the Governor requesting that school educators and school staff be moved up to the Phase 1B group which, at this time, has not happened. As she

stated previously, the General Assembly is reviewing this issue. Superintendent Spearman stated that schools are the safest place to be during this pandemic. She is hoping that there will be a resolution to this issue in the near future. Superintendent Spearman stated that we would be ready, that since last Thursday evening through the past weekend (February 4–7) her staff has been working to ensure that each district is connected with a provider who will do a survey to determine how many vaccines are required for the district, place the vaccine order and be ready to vaccinate educators and their staff, as soon as we are notified to begin vaccinations. She stated that she and the SCDE have taken the lead on this project and she is still talking with some districts, but she has confirmed that there is a provider for every district. Most districts did this on their own, but there were some that the SCDE had to help.

Superintendent Spearman gave an update on the Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplement Appropriations Act stating that

- SC will receive \$940,420,782 in Elementary and Secondary School Relief II (ESSER II) funds
  - 90 percent will flow directly to school districts;
- initial twelve categories from first ESSER grant are still allowable, plus three new categories:
  - addressing learning loss among students,
  - facility repairs and improvements to reduce the risk of virus transmission and exposure, and
  - improvement of in-door air quality in school facilities;
- funds are to be used to reopen schools, provide continuity of operations, and address COVID-19 academic impact; and
- the deadline for spending this money is September 2023.

This concluded Superintendent Spearman's report.

Chair Woodall asked if there were any questions and recognized Mr. Brennan, who asked if it would be appropriate for the SBE to provide a SBE Resolution to Principal Darby. Chair Woodall stated that Mr. Brennan made a great recommendation. Superintendent Spearman stated that she would have her legal office draft the Resolution with the SBE members' names for the March SBE meeting.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Brennan for his suggestion and recognized Dr. West who asked about the prioritization of the teachers. Dr. West stated that she appreciated the opportunity for our speech language pathologists, who do have direct contact with students, but Dr. West wondered if, at any point in Superintendent Spearman's discussions have teachers who work with more high-risk students, particularly in the area of special education in our moderate to severe populations, have those classrooms been considered for priority vaccinations in Superintendent Spearman's conversations. Superintendent Spearman responded yes stating that there is a Vaccine Advisory Committee (VAC), but so far, the VAC, obviously has not approved that recommendation, the Governor could override that, and now the legislature is getting involved, so we will see what happens. Superintendent Spearman feels that there will be some resolution as

to whether or not the General Assembly (GA) will intervene, probably this week. Chair Woodall stated that she was sure some of the districts would also be looking into that issue.

Superintendent Spearman agreed stating that the districts, in working with their providers; however, currently, the move is to work with one group, and the GA may add it to their legislation, but she could not address that at this time.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. West for her questions and recognized Chair-Elect Walters who added that he has had several discussions with Superintendent Spearman and the other SBE members about what, if any, action we as the SBE could take to try to expedite the vaccination process. His take on it, now, is that the situation is still too fluid. We could write a letter or pass a resolution, but he does not know if that would spur any body into action, any more than what is happening now. He would just offer that for any of the others that he did not have a chance to reach out to that certainly, as we continue to monitor what takes place with this, it may come to a point where we feel like we should do something along that line. Mr. Walters stated that given what Superintendent Spearman was working on last week and what the GA is working on now, that perhaps we just need to see how events play out this week. He stated that he was offering this for everyone's consideration.

Chair Woodall thanked Chair-Elect Walters for his question.

Chair Woodall thanked Superintendent Spearman for her report.

## **VII. PARLIAMENTARIAN COMMENTS**

Chair Woodall recognized Ms. Cathy Hazelwood.

Ms. Hazelwood reminded the SBE that their SC Statement of Economic Interest forms (SEI) are due on March 30, 2021. Ms. Hazelwood stated that after today's meeting, she would be happy to help them complete their SEI forms.

This concluded Ms. Hazelwood's report.

Chair Woodall thanked Ms. Hazelwood for her report.

## **VIII. PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

|                              |
|------------------------------|
| <b>IX. STATE BOARD ITEMS</b> |
|------------------------------|

**PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—COMMITTEE REPORT**

No meeting.

**EP EDUCATION PROFESSIONS—COMMITTEE REPORT**

Chair Woodall recognized Mr. English who reported that the committee met and heard one action item(s) and there were no information item(s). One action item(s) was placed on the Consent Agenda.

This concluded Mr. English's report.

**FOR APPROVAL**

**01. Critical Geographic Need Subjects and Schools for Employment of Retired Teachers: 2021–22**—Carla Edwards, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

Ms. Edwards presented the following information to the SBE.

Pursuant to S.C. Code Ann. § 9-1-1795, the SBE must designate annually the critical need subject areas and schools for the employment of retired certified teachers who will be exempt from the earnings limitations imposed S.C. Code Ann. § 9-1-1790.

For the school year 2021–22, and for the purpose of employing retired certified teachers who will be exempt from the earnings limitations, the SBE will define critical need areas as follows:

1. Critical need academic areas for the employment of retired educators were the critical need subject areas identified and approved by the SBE on January 12, 2021, for forgiveness of the South Carolina Teacher Loan Program.
2. Critical need geographic areas for the employment of retired teachers included the following:
  - a. the schools identified and approved by the SBE on January 12, 2021, for forgiveness of the South Carolina Teacher Loan Program; and
  - b. additional schools in any school district in which at least 67 percent of the schools meet the criteria to qualify as a critical need geographic area for the purpose of teacher loan forgiveness; and
  - c. all career and technology centers statewide.

This concluded Ms. Edwards' report.

Mr. English thanked Ms. Edward's for her report.

## **SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—COMMITTEE REPORT**

Chair Woodall recognized Mrs. Stapleton who reported that the committee met and heard one information item(s).

This concluded Mrs. Stapleton's report.

## **FOR INFORMATION**

### **01. District Academic Recovery Plans—Dr. David Mathis, Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness**

Dr. Mathis stated that each school district would be asked to submit to the SCDE their action plan for academic recovery of students in English language arts (ELA) and Math.

- Analysis of test data
  - Partnership with EA
  - Expertise in growth models
  - Developed the growth model for SC Accountability System
  - Developed the RALLY Tool (RALLY)
    - EA developed an interactive tool for teachers and school leaders to understand the academic and wellbeing impact of the current disruption in schooling. RALLY houses historical student data and future student performance predictions in one platform, and link to resources for teachers to help their students catch up and succeed.
  - EA will provide each with a spreadsheet of test data broken out by grade level, subgroups, virtual instruction, face-to-face instruction and grouped by students needing
    - Mild Remediation, Moderate Remediation, and Significant Remediation
- Multi-year Action Plan
- What strategies will the districts have in place to remediate each group?
  - Consider the intensity and amount of time needed to remediate
  - Use of diagnostic assessments
  - Intensive instruction to deficient skills
  - Reassess to determine progress
  - Consider annual growth and additional growth for students needing remediation
- What strategies will the districts have in place to ensure quality Tier 1 instruction?
  - Annual growth for all students
  - Quality Tier 1 instruction creates growth and reduces the need for remediation
- How and when will the plan be evaluated to determine if progress is being made or if a change is needed?

Resource: *Annual Growth for All Students and Catch-up Growth for Those Who are Behind: A Map for Success*

- This document is guided by the book *Annual Growth, Catch-up Growth: Annual Growth for All Students, Catch-up Growth for Those Who Are Behind* (2007) by Lynn Fielding, Nancy Kerr, and Paul Rosier

Once EA has populated the data, the SCDE will provide districts with a template and deadline for submitting plans.

This concluded Dr. Mathis' report.

Ms. Stapleton thanked Dr. Mathis' for his report.

#### **ELC            EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT**

Chair-Elect Walters presented the Educator Licensure Committee (ELC) report.

Chair-Elect Walters stated that the committee met and took action on nine cases, which consisted of one Voluntary Surrender(s) and eight Suspension(s).

Chair Woodall stated that the FB-ELC met at 11:00 a.m. and approved the ELC report.

#### **FB-ELC        FULL BOARD EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT**

Chair Woodall stated the FB-ELC met and took action on four cases, which consisted of one Public Reprimand; one Suspension; and two Permanent Revocations.

|                                 |
|---------------------------------|
| <b>X.        CONSENT AGENDA</b> |
|---------------------------------|

Chair Woodall called for motion to approve of all items on the consent agenda.

Chair-Elect Walters made the motion to approve all items on the consent agenda. Mr. Brennan seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Chair Woodall opened the floor for discussions, there being none, Chair Woodall called for a vote. The members unanimously voted to approve the consent agenda.

#### **PL        POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE— CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

No meeting.

## **EP EDUCATION PROFESSIONS—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

### **FOR APPROVAL**

**01. Identification of Critical Need Subject Areas for 2021-22**—Carla Edwards, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

## **SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—COMMITTEE REPORT**

No items for approval.

## **SBE SOUTH CAROLINA BOARD OF EDUCATION—REPORT**

### **FOR INFORMATION**

**01. Literacy Update**—David Mathis, EdD, Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness

Dr. Mathis introduced Dr. Britt Wilkenfeld, Senior Data Strategist, EA who presented a Power Point on the COVID-19 Impact: Using Interim Test Data to Assess and Respond. Dr. Wilkenfeld discussed the academic impact of COVID-19 and the disruption to student learning. She stated that by using interim assessment data, it enables EA to examine the effect of COVID-19 on learning and to monitor recovery over time. EA is examining the 2017–18, 2018–19, 2019–20, and 2020–21 school years. Questions that can be answered

- How are individual students in the teacher’s classroom doing?
- Did students learn less over the COVID-19 period than they normally would have?
- Did students who experienced an intervention (e.g., related to Act 142) show immediate and long-term benefits?

Dr. Wilkenfeld spoke about the RALLY Analytics Platform explaining that RALLY is a set of interactive tools, which provide

- Student data displays,
- Notebook and grouping feature, and
- Links to SCDE-curated curricular resources.

She also went on to say that RALLY provides comprehensive information about the learning needs of students and can report historical and current year interim and state assessment data, including predictions for 2020–21 assessment scores and that the data is timely and is generally available within one week of testing.

Dr. Wilkenfeld discussed the district use of RALLY stating that 31 school districts are

completely on boarded and 39 school districts are in the queue for onboarding. The Assessments involved include

- Measures of Academic Progress (MAP), STAR Reading/STAR Mathematics (STAR), iReady (since fall 2020);
- CASE Benchmarks (CASE) were added January 2021; and
- Reading Inventory and Math Inventory (RI/MI) are forthcoming.

She discussed the Academic Recovery Camp (ARC) evaluation of the use of the state-funded summer program to combat the effect of COVID-19 on K–3 students that enables the timely use of interim assessment data to examine immediate and lasting effects of the ARC intervention. The evaluation included 29 school districts using MAP, STAR, iReady, CASE, or RI/MI; approximately 5,500 K–3 students were represented; and assessments were administered in June 2020–January 2021 which involved pre-testing, fall post-testing; and winter post-testing.

The ARC findings for only those students who attended ARC showed that there was an impact for the fall and winter test scores. The scores of the ARC students increased from the beginning to the end of the ARC period. On MAP, iReady, and CASE, student scores grew in math and reading. On STAR and RI/MI, student scores grew in math. In addition, the differences by grade level can be seen with the MAP data.

Dr. Wilkenfeld spoke on learning loss and recovery analyses, stating the ability to examine, on average, how learning this year looks different from in prior years. Preliminary findings using MAP data from approximately 30 school districts and additional findings with more coverage will be available in early March 2021. In the area of learning loss, it will show the extent to which student growth from fall 2019 to fall 2020 looks different from in prior years. In addition, in the area of learning recovery, it will show the extent to which winter 2020 scores improved over fall 2020 scores. She also stated that the scores from tests administered in person are more reliable than those tests administered remotely due to questionably high scores.

She discussed the learning recovery preliminary findings on student achievement. Where are students in winter 2020 compared to a standard (achievement) and how is their learning changing over time (growth)? The findings very greatly based on whether students tested in person or remotely. Achievement in a normal year, grade/subject percentile averages should be 50. For math, K and 9th grade students are at or above 50, on average, and for ELA, 5–9th grade students are at or above 50, on average. These grade/subject combinations are performing as would be expected pre-COVID while the other grade/subject combinations are performing behind (i.e., below 50) pre-COVID expectations.

Dr. Wilkenfeld spoke about the learning recovery preliminary findings on growth stating that if students are recovering, their scale score percentiles would increase from fall 2020–winter 2020 and from math students in 1st, 2–5th, and 8th grades achieved a higher percentile on the winter interim assessments, while ELA students mostly declined from fall to winter with the higher percentiles seen only in 1st grade.

Dr. Wilkenfeld stated that the next steps are to

- Provide student-level files to districts to help answer the question: Which students have been the most impacted by COVID, and therefore need the most support?
  - Winter predicted scores
  - Winter actual scores and corresponding tiers
  - Difference between predicted and actual scores, and corresponding tiers
  - For MAP, STAR, iReady, CASE, and RI/MI
- Provide state-level findings to help answer the question: How are learning and growth different this year than other years?

This concluded Dr. Wilkenfeld's report.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. Wilkenfeld and Dr. Mathis and asked if there were any questions.

Chair Woodall and recognized Mr. Butzon who asked if the RALLY data that was presented at the beginning of her talk was a sampling of data or was it actual data from districts and schools.

Dr. Wilkenfeld responded that the data shown was "demo" data to ensure that she does not display actual protected student data.

Mr. Butzon asked if the rest of data in her report is demo data.

Dr. Wilkenfeld responded that all of the other findings in the report are actual data.

Mr. Butzon asked if Dr. Wilkenfeld could contrast one of the last two or three charts referenced growth to compare and contrast the green block that indicated a one in 1st grade with the orange block that indicates a minus 17 also in grade one.

Dr. Wilkenfeld stated that for each individual student, EA has the student's fall score and the student's winter score and each of those scores are linked to a percentile. The point of percentiles to be able to compare across grades. For each student, we look at the difference between the fall percentile and winter percentile with the idea that if the percentile goes up, then the student is showing some growth, and, in this case, some recovery. Each student has that difference value and then we average those up to the grade level. For 1st graders, who tested in school in the fall and winter, on average, they had a percentile point increase of one. Students who tested remotely, on average, their percentiles went down by eight. Students who tested remotely in the fall, but f2f in the winter, on average, their percentiles went down by 17.

Mr. Butzon asked if it was accurate to say that using those same numbers that, in remote only, the students lost nine times as much, and in the remote/f2f return, they lost 18 times as much.

Dr. Wilkenfeld stated yes, but that percentile rates work a little different from regular numbers. She explained that within the grouping of the numbers 1–5, it is the same difference between the numbers 1–2 as there are between the numbers 3–4, and 4–5; however, with percentiles, it is not the same difference. Dr. Wilkenfeld stated you would not say that something that is an eight would be eight times the difference of one. She went on to state that EA has received comments suggestions from the Education Oversight Committee and EA will re-work the data, and will bring the results to the SBE’s March meeting to look at whether the student are meeting or exceeding standards, instead of percentile rates so we can look at percentages and say, 20 percent of the students in this group have met or exceeded standards than the students in this group.

Mr. Butzon stated that it appeared, to him, that improvement is much smaller than decline, and asked if that was a fair statement. Dr. Wilkenfeld concurred.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Butzon and recognized Dr. Green who stated he was confused by what students were included in the sample; what assessments is EA using as a metric in the sample to determine growth. Dr. Green is assuming that EA is using MAP data which would assume that every district administered a fall MAP; however, his district did not administer a fall MAP because of the SCDE’s other mandated assessments that his district was required to administer.

Dr. Wilkenfeld responded that the preliminary findings are limited to MAP data, and partly it is because this was a preliminary analysis that EA turned around in a few days and it was to give a quick and dirty sample of where districts are. There are 30 districts in the state that administered the MAP and had the data available for us to use as a sample run. Let us say that we had 40 districts and of those districts, 10 could not be used because they did not have both the fall and the winter MAP data.

Dr. Green stated that he feels that context data is also important. SC has 80 plus districts and you stated that you had a sampling of 30 districts, and he doesn’t know who those 30 districts are, but it is important that before people draw conclusions about the data that we recognize which districts are being included in the sample. He went on to say that as we compare student performance and growth to preceding years, and as educators, we always want to see students grow at their maximum potential, but this is not a normal year. Dr. Green stated that it baffles him sometimes when people suggest that in the midst of this pandemic, and he listens to items like Principal Darby in North Charleston and the things he did to accommodate the students in his district, but there is a suggestion that even in the face of that, we should see the same kinds of achievement and the same kinds of growth that we have historically. So he would just simply say that as we compare data and talk about where students are, let us please continue to frame it in the context of this being an unprecedented pandemic and that many students are living in conditions; environments; and circumstances that they have never had before.

Dr. Wilkenfeld responded that she agrees completely and she apologized if the report came across that way. She stated that her main purpose is to communicate that SC school districts have met with an impossible task, just like all school districts across the United States, but are meeting it and using data in a way that we have not necessarily seen used across the country. For instance, there have been many national conversations about the need to administer an end of the year state summative assessment. At the point to say with data, is that because of things that the SBE had said months ago, and in prior legislation, is that you have assessment data show where students are and of course, we do not expect them to be where they were last year or in previous years. It is to say that we know where students were, and we can use the data that we have access to and we can prioritize the students who have been impacted the most. We hear you, Dr. Green, and thank you for the reminder on the context.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. Green and Dr. Wilkenfeld and recognized Superintendent Spearman who also thanked Dr. Wilkenfeld and Dr. Green for his statement on context, adding that she is very proud that we started this work two years ago with Dan Ralyea who works with EA. For the past year, we have been using this information for RALLY and this work has put us in a different position, as stated by Dr. Wilkenfeld. This morning, in an earlier meeting, Dr. Wilkenfeld stated that because of S.C. Act 142 of 2020 (Act 142), SC is unique as a state because we do administer fall and winter assessments and we will be doing this again. This is our argument and the substance behind Superintendent Spearman for saying that she does not think we need to give a summative assessment in the spring in order to know where are students are, because we know where they are. Obviously, a big issue is that all districts need to participate, and she wants everyone to know that the information that Dr. Wilkenfeld has shared today that yes, some 30 districts have participated, but there are 39 districts in the que that will be able to give us that information. Superintendent Spearman stated that the agency has been on the phone working with those handful of districts for many different reasons, generally the districts were worried that this would put additional work on their teachers, but this does not put an extra burden on the teachers. It takes what the teachers are already doing, analyzes the information, and gives good data back to the teachers so we can stop putting additional work on teachers with the spring summative assessment. Superintendent Spearman feels confident that the districts reporting will be at 100 percent or as very close to it as possible as we move forward.

Chair Woodall thanked Superintendent Spearman, and recognized Mr. Butzon who stated that he thinks it is important for everyone to remember that before anyone ever heard of COVID-19, SC was in a significant hole with educating more than half of our students. Now, that hole has gotten deeper. He stated that he was not making a statement of criticism, but to make a statement of fact in terms of what we are going to do from here on not to get back to that same hole we were in before COVID-19, but to get to a much shallower hole within some reasonable amount of time to get out of the hole, all together.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Butzon for his comments and Dr. Mathis for his report.

**02. Allendale County School District (ASCD) Update**—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

- On January 25, 2021, a virtual community meeting was held that featured a Martin Luther King, Jr., Oratory Contest.
- Allendale/Fairfax High School Beta Club and National Honor Society are hosting a joint service project called the “Blessing Box.” They have placed the Blessing Box at Freedom Park and it is continuously stocked with non-perishable food items, toiletries and other essentials.
- 296 of elementary, 109 middle school, and 91 high school students are attending f2f in Allendale County.

**Allendale County School District**

2020-2021 Benchmark Results

Assessment Type: TE21

| Grade/<br>Subject | Not Met |        |              | Approaching |        |              | Met    |        |              | Exemplary |        |              |
|-------------------|---------|--------|--------------|-------------|--------|--------------|--------|--------|--------------|-----------|--------|--------------|
|                   | 2018    | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018        | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018   | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018      | 2019   | 2020<br>Post |
| 3rd Math          | 35.50%  | 45.90% | 42.86%       | 29.00%      | 14.90% | 42.86%       | 25.80% | 24.30% | 10.71%       | 9.70%     | 14.90% | 3.57%        |
| 4th Math          | 72.30%  | 52.40% | 33.96%       | 20.50%      | 29.30% | 52.83%       | 4.80%  | 14.60% | 11.32%       | 2.40%     | 3.70%  | 1.89%        |
| 5th Math          | 78.40%  | 59.00% | 36.96%       | 16.50%      | 28.90% | 54.35%       | 5.20%  | 9.60%  | 8.70%        | 0.00%     | 2.40%  | 0.00%        |
| 6th Math          | 58.70%  | 53.30% | 47.22%       | 25.30%      | 34.80% | 47.22%       | 10.70% | 8.70%  | 5.56%        | 5.30%     | 3.30%  | 0.00%        |
| 7th Math          | 63.60%  | 62.50% | 59.65%       | 22.70%      | 30.00% | 29.82%       | 9.10%  | 7.50%  | 10.53%       | 4.50%     | 0.00%  | 0.00%        |
| 8th Math          | 17.70%  | 39.10% | 55.32%       | 50.00%      | 35.90% | 42.55%       | 24.20% | 15.60% | 2.13%        | 8.10%     | 9.40%  | 0.00%        |

| Grade/<br>Subject | Not Met |        |              | Approaching |        |              | Met    |        |              | Exemplary |        |              |
|-------------------|---------|--------|--------------|-------------|--------|--------------|--------|--------|--------------|-----------|--------|--------------|
|                   | 2018    | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018        | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018   | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018      | 2019   | 2020<br>Post |
| 3rd Reading       | 53.80%  | 60.00% | 49.09%       | 32.30%      | 26.70% | 32.73%       | 11.80% | 12.00% | 14.55%       | 2.20%     | 1.30%  | 3.64%        |
| 4th Reading       | 65.10%  | 50.60% | 25.45%       | 21.70%      | 21.70% | 40.00%       | 7.20%  | 14.80% | 34.55%       | 6.00%     | 7.40%  | 0.00%        |
| 5th Reading       | 68.00%  | 59.00% | 46.94%       | 24.70%      | 24.70% | 36.73%       | 7.20%  | 12.00% | 16.33%       | 0.00%     | 0.00%  | 0.00%        |
| 6th Reading       | 42.70%  | 59.80% | 54.05%       | 40.00%      | 40.00% | 32.43%       | 14.70% | 7.60%  | 10.81%       | 2.70%     | 2.70%  | 0.00%        |
| 7th Reading       | 63.10%  | 48.10% | 36.67%       | 23.10%      | 23.10% | 45.00%       | 12.30% | 15.20% | 18.33%       | 1.50%     | 1.50%  | 0.00%        |
| 8th Reading       | 31.10%  | 54.70% | 55.32%       | 36.10%      | 36.10% | 42.55%       | 19.70% | 14.10% | 2.13%        | 13.10%    | 13.10% | 0.00%        |

**03. Florence County School District Four (FCSD-4) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement**

- Three Timmonsville High School students received their MIG Welding certifications.
- 159 of elementary students, 57 middle school students and 37 high school students are participating in hybrid f2f education.

**Florence School District 4**

2020-2021 Benchmark Results

Assessment Type: HMH Math and Reading Inventory

| Grade/<br>Subject | DNM    |        |              | Approaches |        |              | Meets  |        |              | Exceeds |        |              |
|-------------------|--------|--------|--------------|------------|--------|--------------|--------|--------|--------------|---------|--------|--------------|
|                   | 2018   | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018       | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018   | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018    | 2019   | 2020<br>Post |
| 3rd Math          | 56.40% | 45.50% | 68.00%       | 17.90%     | 34.10% | 24.00%       | 23.10% | 18.20% | 8.00%        | 2.60%   | 2.30%  | 0.00%        |
| 4th Math          | 57.10% | 70.80% | 50.00%       | 19.60%     | 25.00% | 33.33%       | 17.90% | 2.10%  | 10.00%       | 5.40%   | 2.10%  | 6.66%        |
| 5th Math          | 63.10% | 52.50% | 52.63%       | 29.20%     | 27.10% | 47.37%       | 6.20%  | 15.30% | 0.00%        | 1.50%   | 5.10%  | 0.00%        |
| 6th Math          | 48.50% | 56.30% | 41.00%       | 34.80%     | 31.00% | 41.00%       | 13.60% | 11.30% | 14.00%       | 3.00%   | 1.40%  | 5.00%        |
| 7th Math          | 66.00% | 55.90% | 54.00%       | 27.70%     | 35.30% | 27.00%       | 2.10%  | 7.40%  | 19.00%       | 4.30%   | 1.50%  | 0.00%        |
| 8th Math          | 50.00% | 61.50% | 57.00%       | 41.20%     | 23.10% | 30.00%       | 8.80%  | 5.10%  | 9.00%        | 0.00%   | 10.30% | 4.00%        |

| Grade/<br>Subject | DNM    |        |              | Approaches |        |              | Meets |        |              | Exceeds |       |              |
|-------------------|--------|--------|--------------|------------|--------|--------------|-------|--------|--------------|---------|-------|--------------|
|                   | 2018   | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018       | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018  | 2019   | 2020<br>Post | 2018    | 2019  | 2020<br>Post |
| 3rd Reading       | 59.00% | 59.10% | 54.05%       | 28.20%     | 27.30% | 27.02%       | 12.8% | 11.40% | 18.91%       | 0.00%   | 2.30% | 0.00%        |
| 4th Reading       | 64.30% | 77.10% | 56.52%       | 19.60%     | 6.30%  | 21.73%       | 16.1% | 8.30%  | 21.73%       | 0.00%   | 8.30% | 0.00%        |
| 5th Reading       | 72.30% | 61.00% | 56.52%       | 21.50%     | 22.00% | 17.39%       | 6.2%  | 15.30% | 21.73%       | 0.00%   | 1.70% | 4.34%        |
| 6th Reading       | 65.20% | 46.50% | 54.00%       | 30.30%     | 43.70% | 35.00%       | 4.5%  | 8.50%  | 5.00%        | 0.00%   | 1.40% | 5.00%        |
| 7th Reading       | 76.60% | 57.40% | 47.00%       | 17.00%     | 30.90% | 22.00%       | 4.3%  | 10.30% | 24.00%       | 2.10%   | 1.50% | 7.00%        |
| 8th Reading       | 52.90% | 65.00% | 31.00%       | 32.40%     | 22.50% | 41.00%       | 5.9%  | 5.00%  | 17.00%       | 8.80%   | 7.50% | 11.00%       |

**04. Williamsburg County School District (WCSD) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement**

- The district worked with the SCDE Office of Special Education Services to review district and special education goals in early January.
- Prior to holiday break, 565 elementary, 196 middle school, and 162 high school students were attending face-to-face classes. February 1, 2021, data indicates that 432 elementary, 138 middle school, and 120 high school students are attending f2f in the county.

### MAP Data Analysis

| Grade Level     | READING                                      | MATH                                         |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
|                 | % of students meeting projected growth goals | % of students meeting projected growth goals |
| 3 <sup>rd</sup> | 43.90%                                       | 48.75%                                       |
| 4 <sup>th</sup> | 33.80%                                       | 47.20%                                       |
| 5 <sup>th</sup> | 37.40%                                       | 55.70%                                       |
| 6 <sup>th</sup> | 42.18%                                       | 32.20%                                       |
| 7 <sup>th</sup> | 37.60%                                       | 49.40%                                       |
| 8 <sup>th</sup> | 46.00%                                       | 64.06%                                       |

Chair Woodall thanked Ms. Mack and asked if there were any questions.

#### **05. Clarendon School District One Update**—Steven Strother, Finance Director, Office of Finance

Mr. Strother previously reported to the State Board of Education that

David Loadholt, the contract CFO for the SDE, is working with the SC Retirement System (RS), The IRS, and the SC Department of Revenue (DOR) to settle the liabilities to those systems (in the amount of roughly \$1.3 Million)

Since the last report, Mr. Strother stated:

- the IRS liability has been paid in full (roughly \$800,000), and is up to date through December 31, 2020;
- the IRS Obligation has been paid in full (\$425,000.00);
- the Obligation to the DOR had been paid in full (approximately \$125,000); and
- these are some of the liabilities that contributed to the financial management takeover of CSD-1, and have been settled in full.

After reviewing cash-flow information for January 2021, the cash flow deficit at the end of June 30, 2021, is projected to be \$408,000.00.

Current actions:

- the spending freeze remains in effect, reducing Accounts Payable costs;
- open positions are not being filled and some of the open positions where savings have occurred include
  - the Assistant Superintendent of Special Services retired November 30, 2020 (CSD-3 is covering the services for a stipend from CSD-1;
  - transportation between the two districts was consolidated as of January 1, 2021;
  - a vacant Human Resource (HR) position remains un-filled with the HR duties being handled by CSD-4;
  - a Medicaid Clerk position became open, and will not be filled; and

- a Music teacher position became open and CSD-2 is sharing those services to ensure the CSD-1 band students can continue to receive instruction.
- the department with assistance of David Loadholt has identified expenses that can be shifted from the general fund to the CARES/ESSER funds received by the district;
- the CSD-1 Superintendent has submitted a proposal for a reduction of staff expenditures;
- measures to help reduce the deficit are continually being discussed;
- the SCDE Finance Office has representatives onsite in CSD-1, one day per week to assist with entering and approving federal budgets and the filing of federal claims;
- the CSD-1 Board of Trustees is being updated monthly on the financial condition of the district; and the SBE is being updated monthly on the financial condition of the CSD-1.

This concluded Mr. Strother's update.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Strother and asked if there were any questions.

Chair Woodall recognized Mr. Butzon, who congratulated Mr. Loadholt and Mr. Strother on the significant amount of progress that has been accomplished on this catching up the payments to the RS; the DOR; and the IRS. However, there was concern during the course of digging out of this financial hole, would we be digging the educational hole any deeper. Mr. Butzon is wondering if anybody is balancing the good news of what all of your group have accomplished in paying off debts; reducing expenditures; and improving the financial management side, is anyone working on balancing that in terms of educating children.

Mr. Strother responded that his and Mr. Loadholt's responsibility is to oversee the financial issues affecting the district. So far, they have been able to refrain from cutting positions. The cuts have been made without a reduction in staff.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Strother for his update and thanked him for all the work that they done for CSD-1.

Chair Woodall recognized Betsy Carpentier who stated that when the SCDE took over CSD-1 the projected deficit was close to \$1.5M, Mr. Strother and Mr. Loadholt have reduced that to \$400,000, which is a significant shift, and Ms. Carpentier believes that was done without impacting the quality of education in CSD-1. The CSD-3 and CSD-4 are taking on the services that are necessary for the vacancies in CSD-1.

Chair Woodall thanked Ms. Carpentier for providing that information.

|                           |
|---------------------------|
| <b>XI. OTHER BUSINESS</b> |
|---------------------------|

|                         |
|-------------------------|
| <b>XII. ADJOURNMENT</b> |
|-------------------------|

The meeting adjourned at 1:33 p.m.