MEETING MINUTES
State Board of Education Meeting

DATE
Tuesday, April 13, 2021

TIME
12:00 p.m.

LOCATION
Rutledge Conference Center
1429 Senate Street
Columbia, SC 29201

Kristi Woodall, Ed.D., Chair
Alan Walters, Chair-Elect
Molly M. Spearman, State Superintendent of Education,
Secretary and Administrative Officer to the Board

If you require Section 504 or ADA accommodations to attend or participate in this public meeting, please contact Noelle Redd.

Notice: Due to allergies of staff and visitors, we ask that visitors refrain from wearing scented products when attending the State Board of Education meetings in SCDE facilities.

SBE Mission: The State Board of Education's mission is to provide a leadership role in helping South Carolina set policy and direction to transform teaching and learning so that students are prepared with the necessary knowledge and skills, including innovation, to compete globally and live a productive life.

In addition to Chair Woodall, the following State Board of Education (SBE) members were also physically attending Chair-Elect Alan Walters, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit; Crystal Stapleton, Second Judicial Circuit; Delaney K. Frierson, Third Judicial Circuit; Carl Hinze, Seventh Judicial Circuit; Sallie R. Lee, Tenth Judicial Circuit; Jean W. Pearson, Twelfth Judicial Circuit; and Michael Brenan, the Governor's Appointee.

Members attending virtually were Jon Butzon, First Judicial Circuit; Cathy D. Chapman, Fourth Judicial Circuit; Dr. Tracy West, Fifth Judicial Circuit; Dr. J.R. Green, Sixth Judicial Circuit; Cynthia A. Downs, Ed.D., Eighth Judicial Circuit; Larry Kobrovsky, Ninth Judicial Circuit; David Whittemore, Thirteenth Judicial Circuit; and Valaree C. Smith, Fourteenth Judicial Circuit.

The following South Carolina Department of Education (SCDE) staff were physically attending:

Molly Spearman, State Superintendent of Education; Noelle Redd, SBE Minutes Taker, Division for Legal Affairs; Cathy Hazelwood, Deputy Superintendent and Parliamentarian, Division for Legal Affairs; Ryan Brown, Chief Communications Officer; Barbara A. Drayton, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; David Mathis, Ed.D., Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness; L. Monique Curry, Data and Reporting Education Associate, Office of Standards and Learning, Division of College and Career Readiness; Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Office of Finance; Steven Strother, Finance Director, Office of Finance; Travis Huggins, Information Technology Manager I, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Lewis Chambers, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Quinn Murphy, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; and Alexandra Robinson, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations.

SCDE staff attending virtually were: Betsy Carpentier, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Karla Hawkins, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; John Payne, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; Mary Hipp, Director, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; James Ritter, PhD, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; Jaclyn Walsh, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; Sarah Longshore, Director, State Accountability, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; Susan Murphy, Education Associate, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; Ms. Kriss Stewart, Program Coordinator, Instructional Materials Adoption Program, Office of Finance; and Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement.

I. WELCOME/PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The SBE meeting convened at 12:00 p.m. Chair Woodall called the meeting to order. Chair Woodall welcomed everyone who attended either physically or virtually.

Chair-Elect Walters led everyone in the Pledge of Allegiance. (Due to the pandemic, all JROTC performances are discontinued until further notice.)

II. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES FOR MARCH 9, 2021

Chair Woodall asked if there were any objections to approving the minutes as presented for the SBE meeting on March 9, 2021. Hearing no objections, the minutes were approved by unanimous consent.

III. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION SPECIAL CALLED MEETING MINUTES FOR MARCH 30, 2021

Chair Woodall asked if there were any objections to approving the minutes as presented for the SBE's special called meeting on March 30, 2021. Hearing no objections, the minutes were approved by unanimous consent.

IV. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AGENDA FOR APRIL 13, 2021

Chair Woodall asked if there were any objections to approving the agenda as presented for the April 13, 2021, SBE meeting. Hearing no objections, Chair Woodall asked for a motion. Mr. Brenan made the motion to approve the April 13, 2021, agenda. Mr. Walters seconded the motion. The motion passed.

V. RECOGNITION OF VISITORS AND NEWS MEDIA

The following visitors were present:

- South Carolina 2020 Presidential Award for Excellence in Mathematics and Science Teaching (PAEMST) Finalists
    - Julie Stone, Cherokee Trail Elementary–Abbeville County School District;
    - Michelle Traynum, Homeland Park Primary–Anderson County School District Five;
    - Erica Aiken, Mauldin Middle School–Greenville County School District;
    - Kimberly Rothberg, Carolina Forest Elementary–Horry County School District;
    - Warren Wise, Kelly Mill Med Pro Middle, Richland County School District Two; and
    - Ruth Howell, Lyman Elementary School–Spartanburg County School District Five.

VI. STATE BOARD CHAIR REPORT

Chair Woodall thanked the SBE members for being available, with short notice, for the March 30, 2021, Special Called Meeting to discuss the Student Athletic Waiver request.

VII. STATE SUPERINTENDENT OF EDUCATION REPORT

Superintendent Spearman welcomed everyone who attended today's meeting either physically or virtually. She began her report by giving an update on the Methods of Instruction (MOI)

beginning with the district information. She stated that 72 of the state's 79 districts are currently offering full five-day face-to-face (f2f) instruction for all students. The following six districts are moving towards the five-day f2f instruction model by the dates shown

- (4/19/21) Florence 3, Lexington 1, Orangeburg, Sumter;
- (4/26/21) Hampton 2;
- (5/3/21) Colleton; and
- the Greenville school district does not have a date to move to full five-day f2f instruction for all students. Currently, they are five-day f2f for grades K–8 and 4 days for high school.

Superintendent Spearman stated that there is legislation moving through the General Assembly (GA). The Senate has passed the legislation and it will be in the House Full Education Committee (HFEC) today or tomorrow, that sets the date of April 12th, which was yesterday, to say that all districts would return to full five-day f2f instruction or provide another option for parents. The HFEC will need to amend the April 12th date in that piece of legislation. She stated that she supports that legislation.

Superintendent Spearman followed with an update on the delivery model MOI for district schools stating that of the 1,267 schools

- 1,164 schools were operating full f2f MOI;
- 96 schools were operating 2–4 days using a hybrid MOI; and
- 1 school was operating in a virtual MOI (this does not include the five online virtual charter schools.).

Superintendent Spearman provided a graph with an update on the COVID-19 cases reported among school employees stating that since we started reporting this data in August 2020. The graph showed a spike in cases to 275 cases in mid-December 2020 caused by the Thanksgiving holidays and then on January 2, with the schools closed for the winter break, the cases dropped to below 50 cases. Then you can see where the numbers jumped back up to above 250 cases on March 7th. On March 8th, Phase 1b opened, allowing school officials to be vaccinated which, as you can see, by March 27th, the numbers have dropped to well below 100 cases. We believe that all teaches who want to take the shot have been able to get the vaccine and we are very happy. We do have a plan in place that we are working on, a public relations plan working on grassroots education, working with leaders in the areas of the state where the vaccination percentages have been low. The SCDE is working with leaders that we know in those communities to help educate and promote the vaccine among not just school district staff, but also the entire community and that project has been going well.

Superintendent Spearman stated that today was a day of celebration. She stated that we owe so much to our teachers for the excellent work they do every day with our students, particularly this past year. Superintendent Spearman introduced six outstanding teachers, along with their guests, in the audience who were being recognized as being selected as finalist for the South Carolina

2020 Presidential Awards for Excellence in Mathematics and Science Teaching (PAEMST). Superintendent Spearman asked Monique Curry, who handles this awards program for the SCDE, to give a brief overview of the PAEMST program.

Ms. Curry stated the PAEMST awards are the highest honors bestowed by the United States government specifically for K–12 science, technology, engineering, mathematics, and/or computer science teachers. Congress established the Awards in 1983. The President may recognize up to 108 exemplary teachers each year. The PAEMST award is broken down into two segments, K–6 and 7–12. The award recognizes those teachers that have both deep content knowledge of the subjects they teach and the ability to motivate and enable students to be successful in those areas. The awards are given to science, technology, engineering, mathematics, and/or computer science teachers from each of the 50 states, the District of Columbia, the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, the Department of Defense Education Activity schools, or the U.S. territories as a group (American Samoa, Guam, the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands, and U.S. Virgin Islands). The award recognizes those teachers have both deep content knowledge of the subjects they teach and the ability to motivate and enable students to be successful in those areas. Since the program's inception, more than 5,000 teachers have been recognized for their contributions in the classroom and to their profession. Awardees reflect the expertise and dedication of the Nation's teaching corps, and they demonstrate the positive impact of excellent teachers on student achievement. The National Science Foundation administers PAEMST on behalf of The White House Office of Science and Technology Policy.

Ms. Curry stated that during our 2020 K–6 award period, a committee of esteemed educators reviewed the SC application submissions and elected three finalist from each category, math and science, to represent our state as a part of SC's incredible teaching force. The three math and three science finalists we are honoring today have demonstrated, through their expertise, the positive impact of effective teaching on student achievement. We truly thank you for your mark in education as you mold our next generation, and wish you best of luck as you have entered the next steps for the PAEMST award.

Superintendent Spearman called each of the finalist to the podium for recognition.

- Erica Aiken, Mauldin Middle School–Greenville County School District (SBE Member: David Whittemore, Thirteenth Judicial Circuit);
    - 13th year of teaching 6th grade math;
    - Focuses on making math engaging and fun for her students; and
    - Strives to help students understand real-world applications using math.
- Ruth Howell, Lyman Elementary School–Spartanburg County School District Five (SBE Member: Carl Hinze, Seventh Judicial Circuit);
    - 21st year of teaching–13th at Lyman; and
    - Strives to create an interdisciplinary, STEAM-infused classroom building on the characteristics of the *Profile of the South Carolina Graduate*.

- Kimberly Rothberg, Carolina Forest Elementary–Horry County School District (SBE Member: Chair-Elect Alan Walters, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit);
    - 14th year of teaching in Horry County;
    - Currently teaches 3–5 grade gifted and talented Math; and
    - Was a 2017 finalist for PAEMST.
- Julie Stone, Cherokee Trail Elementary–Abbeville County School District (SBE Member: Dr. Cynthia Downs, Eighth Judicial Circuit);
    - 15th year of teaching in Abbeville County;
    - Currently teaches 3rd grade ELA and Science; and
    - Encourages her students to collaborate with each other to problem solve, make discoveries, and explore the world around them.
- Warren Wise, Kelly Mill Med Pro Middle, Richland County School District Two (SBE Member: Dr. Tracy West, Fifth Judicial Circuit);
    - 18 years teaching;
    - The 6th grade science teacher was one of 18 educators selected for the PBS Digital Innovator All-Star Program; and
    - 2019 SC STEM Educator of the Year.
- Michelle Traynum, Homeland Park Primary–Anderson County School District Five (unable to attend today's meeting) (SBE Member: Sallie Lee, Tenth Judicial Circuit);
    - 20+ years of teaching elementary;
    - Currently serves as STEAM teacher and math coach; and
    - 2018 District Teacher of the Year in Anderson Five.

The finalists received a round of applause. Superintendent Spearman stated that she was honored to have great teachers.

Superintendent Spearman stated that early in her career as State Superintendent she had brought some of the bus drivers to a SBE meeting to thank them for their service and quick thinking to get students safely off the buses when a few of them caught on fire. She went on to say that since 2015–present, the SCDE has been able to turn that situation around. Superintendent Spearman stated that she had just returned from a press conference where Governor McMaster (Governor) and Mr. Farmer from the SC Department of Insurance announced that the SCDE will receive $23.8M of the $24M that was left in the Volkswagen settlement money to buy 235 propane buses. This purchase will make our propane fleet 400+ buses, which will make SC the largest propane school bus fleet nationwide. We are supposed to have a 15-year replacement cycle, with this our 5,000+ buses that are on a daily route, the average age is now around 5 years. Now, we are in a much better place, and everything is important to the system. We talk about if one part of the system is broken, then the entire system does not work. She stated that over the weekend, she spoke with a transportation director of a small district who stated that in 2015 out of the 30 buses they have, 3–4 would break down every morning and be late to school, and now they have zero breakdowns. She hears the same story all over the state. It took all of us along with the General Assembly; the Governor's Office; Mr. Farmer; and our incredible staff in the SCDE's Office of Transportation; and the district transportation offices to accomplish this task. She is very proud of being able to say we are leading the nation in this area.

This concluded Superintendent Spearman's report.

Chair Woodall thanked Superintendent Spearman for her report and added that as a former science teacher, she is so proud of and happy for the PAEMST finalists.

Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions and recognized Dr. Green.

Dr. Green had a comment for Superintendent Spearman relative to the five-day per week return to f2f instruction legislation. He has communicated to the members of the General Assembly some concerns that he has relative to the attempted legislation. He was interested to hear that Superintendent Spearman supported it. Dr. Green's concern is not about returning five-days per week f2f instruction as a district like his has been providing that option since the first of the year. His concern is the limit it places on districts to develop instructional programs where teachers are teaching students virtually and f2f. A couple of concerns, in that regard, are that there will be some students who we recognize that potentially will not return for f2f instruction because they are concerned about the COVID-19 crisis; and there are some who just appreciate the opportunity to work in this virtual environment and want to remain doing so, for a while. So when we say that districts cannot develop those kinds of learning models where teachers can teach virtually or f2f, Dr. Green thinks it is going to limit opportunities for students and secondly, the transition for students from virtual to f2f is mitigated when they can work with the same teacher. Therefore, if we say they have to be with a teacher that is only dedicated to teaching virtual, it is going to potentially cause many disruptions to the system if a student decides that he or she is going to move from virtual to f2f. Dr. Green suggested that Superintendent Spearman think about her support of that legislation since we know that there are districts that have teachers providing instruction virtually and f2f. How do you anticipate what impact is of the instructional programs that we have developed and been implementing all year long.

Superintendent Spearman thanked Dr. Green and replied that she understands what Dr. Green is saying and she, too, has been concerned about the burden this places on teachers. She stated that she worked with the Palmetto State Teacher's Association (PSTA), and others, to amend the bill. In the beginning, the legislation was worded to prohibit teachers from working in a hybrid and f2f model at the same time. Now the legislation has been amended to say, "if the teacher agrees" to work both models at the same time. Superintendent Spearman stated that she does believe the teachers should be compensated for agreeing to teach both models at the same time.

Dr. Green stated he had not read the latest version of the legislation, but if this portion has been amended, then his concerns have been addressed. Superintendent Spearman confirmed that the latest version has the amendment.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. Green and Superintendent Spearman for their comments and asked if there were any further questions.

VIII. PARLIAMENTARIAN COMMENTS

No report.

IX. PUBLIC COMMENT

No comments.

X. STATE BOARD ITEMS

PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—COMMITTEE REPORT
Did not meet.

EP EDUCATION PROFESSIONS—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Woodall recognized Mrs. Pearson who reported that the committee met and heard three action item(s) and one information item(s). The three action item(s) were placed on the Consent Agenda.

This concluded Mrs. Pearson's report.

FOR APPROVAL

01. Educator Preparation Program Modifications: Clemson University—James Ritter, PhD, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

02. New Educator Preparation Program Approval Recommendation: Masters of Arts in Teaching (MAT) in Visual Art K–12 at Lander University—James Ritter, PhD, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

03. Approval of Member to Serve on the Professional Review Committee (PRC)—Jaclyn Walsh, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

FOR INFORMATION

04. Professional Review Committee (PRC): Educator Preparation Provider and Updates—Jaclyn Walsh, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Woodall recognized Mrs. Stapleton who reported that the committee met and heard two action item(s) and no information item(s). The two action item(s) were placed on the consent agenda.

This concluded Mrs. Stapleton's report.

FOR APPROVAL

01. WIDA English Language Development Standards Framework Re-Adoption—Dr. Sarah Longshore, Director, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement and Ms. Susan Murphy, Education Associate, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

02. Appointment Recommendations for the 2021 Instructional Materials Review Panels—Ms. Kriss Stewart, Program Coordinator, Instructional Materials Adoption Program, Office of Finance

FOR INFORMATION

No items.

ELC EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair-Elect Walters presented the Educator Licensure Committee (ELC) report.

Chair-Elect Walters stated that the committee met and took action on twelve case(s), which consisted of one Revocation(s) and eleven Suspension(s). Chair-Elect Walters stated that none of the cases involved COVID-related issues.

Chair-Elect Walters thanked and commended the Office of General Counsel on their ability and diligence to obtain five consent orders, prior to today's meeting. He also stated that none of today's cases were COVID-related.

Chair Woodall asked if there was any further discussion.

Chair Woodall stated that the FB-ELC met at 11:00 a.m. and ratified the ELC report.

FB-ELC FULL BOARD EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Woodall stated the FB-ELC met and took action on two case(s), which consisted of one Permanent Revocation(s) and one Voluntary Surrender(s).

XI. CONSENT AGENDA

Chair Woodall called for a motion to approve all items on the consent agenda.

Mr. Brenan made the motion to approve all items on the consent agenda. Mrs. Stapleton seconded the motion. The motion passed.

Chair Woodall opened the floor for discussions, there being none, Chair Woodall called for a vote. The members unanimously voted to approve the consent agenda.

PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

Did not meet.

EP EDUCATION PROFESSIONS—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

FOR APPROVAL

01. Educator Preparation Program Modifications: Clemson University—James Ritter, PhD, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

02. New Educator Preparation Program Approval Recommendation: Masters of Arts in Teaching (MAT) in Visual Art K–12 at Lander University—James Ritter, PhD, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

03. Approval of Member to Serve on the Professional Review Committee (PRC)—Jaclyn Walsh, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—COMMITTEE REPORT

FOR APPROVAL

01. WIDA English Language Development Standards Framework Re-Adoption—Dr. Sarah Longshore, Director, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement and Ms. Susan Murphy, Education Associate, Office of Federal and State Accountability, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

02. Appointment Recommendations for the 2021 Instructional Materials Review Panels—Ms. Kriss Stewart, Program Coordinator, Instructional Materials Adoption Program, Office of Finance

SBE SOUTH CAROLINA BOARD OF EDUCATION—REPORT

FOR INFORMATION

01. Literacy Update—David Mathis, EdD, Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness

Read to Succeed

The United States Department of Education (USED) denied the SCDE's request to waive the state summative assessments; therefore, SC Ready will be administered in spring 2021 and mandatory retention will be in place for third grade students who fail to score above the "Not Met 1" level. Summer Reading Camps (SRC) will be offered as a good cause exemption for students who do not meet the requirements for promotion. If a third grade student does not complete SC READY, districts should use other available data, including interim assessment results, to determine which third grade students require additional interventions, including invitation to SRC. Districts are also reminded that retention decisions for third graders may be based on other factors beyond the Act 284 requirements, such as substantially below grade level performance in math or English language Arts (ELA) on interim assessments. Districts should consult local school board policy on student retention and decisions should be made by school and/or district-level teams. As a pre-filter for further consideration, districts should use the most recent predictive score on the Rally datasheet distributed in March 2021 as an indicator that a student may need further support.

During the third nine weeks, districts notified parents if their child was at risk of retention due to substantially below grade level performance in reading and districts will send invitations to SRC during the fourth nine weeks. The SRCs are in place for this summer. The camps will run a minimum of four days per week; four hours per day; for six weeks or for the equivalent of that many hours per week.

Child Early Reading and Development Education Program (CERDEP) Expansion

Forty-five school districts are offering 4K CERDEP 2021 summer programming and eight of those districts are offering extended day during the summer. Six districts are extending the 2020–21 program throughout the summer to their CERDEP students.

Thirteen districts have requested a total of 39 new classrooms for the 2021–22 school year and forty-six districts plan to offer extended day, extended year, and/or summer programming for 4K CERDEP students for the 2021–22 school year.

Academic Recovery Plans (ARP)

Academic Recovery Plans are due to the SCDE from each district no later than May 28, 2021. Education Analytics (EA) provided each school district a spreadsheet of historical and current data from interim and summative assessments. EA converted interim assessments to a common SC Ready scale, used summative and interim assessments to predict scores as if COVID had not occurred and measured the gap in growth between the current interim and projected interim scores to determine the achievement gap. Data for students in subgroups including Pupils in Poverty, Students with Disabilities, Multi-lingual Learners Gifted and Talented, Race, Gender, and percentage of remote days through December 31, 2020. Districts received district and school level data. In addition to data being reported by quartiles, districts received data disaggregated into three tiers of students needing mild, moderate, or significant remediation.

In completing the ARP template, districts must set measurable goals for student growth and achievement in ELA and math. All goals should address how the district will accelerate learning, using measurable targets that maximize growth for all students and provide necessary catch-up growth for some. By accelerating learning, districts should focus on moving students from below grade level expectations to meeting and exceeding grade level expectations. Districts should consider differentiated goals for grade bands or specific grade levels based on students with mild, moderate, or significant academic impacts from the pandemic. Goals may address broad or narrow populations based on data analysis and identified need.

In addition to providing goals, districts should also include strategies for meeting these goals, a description of how these strategies address each tier of learning lag (mild, moderate, and significant) goal timelines (i.e. fall to spring goal, spring to spring goal, 2-year goal, etc.), plans for evaluating progress toward goals, and funding source(s) used to meet identified goals. The beauty of this plan is that if we are not making progress, we can back up and change those goals to do what matters most.

Districts were provided with the attached Map for Success to use as a tool in developing their ARPs. Dr. Mathis informed the SBE members that he would have Ms. Redd email the Map for Success to the members after todays meeting. This roadmap was based on the book, "*Annual Growth for All Students, Catch-up Growth for Those Who Are Behind*" by Lynn Fielding, Nancy Kerr, & Paul Rosier. Dr. Mathis stated that for the past ten years, this has been his favorite book. The book talks about how we have to focus on core instruction, that is tier 1 instruction for all students. All students make the growth that they need every year, but those that are behind make the "catch-up growth" as well. Dr. Mathis stated that if any of the SBE members were interested in reading the book, to email him and he will send them a copy of the book. Dr. Moore and her staff used this book to create the roadmap as a tool for the districts. Once we receive the ARPs, feedback will

be provided back to each district on how we expect them to make progress towards those goals.

This concluded Dr. Mathis' report.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. Mathis for his report. Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions and recognized Mr. Brenan who commended Dr. Mathis on his update. He had a question concerning the issue of SC not being granted a waiver for summative testing and Mr. Brenan asked if Dr. Mathis was aware of waivers being granted to other states. Superintendent Spearman stated that yes, a few waivers were granted to other states. She went on to say that, obviously, we were very disappointed that our request was not granted. A telephone conference was held last week with US Secretary of Education, Miguel Cardona (Secretary), and the State Superintendents of Education discussing our concerns. It appears that, for instance, the District of Columbia (D.C.) received their waiver approval by copying our waiver request. Their approval waiver request was written like ours. They saw what we had suggested. The difference was that they still have approximately 80 percent of their student population who are at home, whereas, SC is almost the opposite. SC has more of their student population f2f in school instead of at home. Superintendent Spearman thinks that because we had more of our students back, this was the reason the waiver was denied. She went on to say that the Secretary has committed himself to the conversation about how best to assess our students nationally, that we will have a broad and robust conversation about this. Superintendent Spearman stated that she is not going to let up on what she thinks we have done in SC; how successful it appears to be and can become. She also stated that we have been invited by the National Association of School Superintendents to give a presentation on what our staff has accomplished. Superintendent Spearman stated that she is very proud of what her staff has done; however, she is very disappointed that our waiver request was denied. She stated that Colorado had a similar suggestion, which was approved. Colorado is testing a few of their grades, but not all of their grades. California was approved because they are offering the assessment; however, they are allowing the districts to not make decisions. Those were a few approvals that were very similar to what we requested, which is disappointing. Superintendent Spearman stated that many hours were spent preparing the waiver; we did our best; and she thinks that we caught the eyebrows of other states on what we have been able to accomplish and she hopes that the conversation will continue.

Chair Woodall thanked Superintendent Spearman for her comments and asked if there were any further comments or questions and recognized Mr. Butzon who stated that he had questions for both Dr. Mathis and Superintendent Spearman. Mr. Butzon asked why we do not want to test students. Superintendent Spearman responded that we have to assess our students and she believes we should do it in a manner that gives the best, most accurate information that can be used by our teachers and the Department, as policy holders. For a long time, to get statewide answers was through the current system of summative assessments. However, new tools have been developed and are being developed that allow us to get information on a statewide level through using the interim assessments. It is not that I am opposed, nor do I think we should not assess, we have to assess. It would be absurd to say we are not going to assess, she agrees totally with giving assessments, but she thinks that the assessment industry has evolved; it is getting stronger; there are new tools that we need to look at; and that was what we were proposing that we be allowed to do. She felt that we had information that should be adequate for, particularly

this year, and possibly for the future. The thing is that we know that through our interim assessments we were able to give those assessments virtually, so for those families who choose not to come back f2f, we can still assess their children. Virtual assessment may not be an ideal situation, but it is better than no assessment at all. We were able to do that using our interim assessment. Now, we have been told that we cannot use that information for the final decision; you have to use the regular spring assessment, which cannot be delivered virtually. Now, we are telling families to bring their children in and Superintendent Spearman thinks that some families will not bring their children in to be assessed. She thinks that the participation rate will have been higher through the interim assessments that we have been giving versus trying to get students to come into the schools for the regular spring assessment. As you know, the USED has established a 95 percent penalty on states and districts if they do not have at least 95 percent of their students assessed. The penalty is in place to keep states from telling students to stay home. She cannot imagine anyone telling their students that, but that rule has been waived, so Superintendent Spearman does not have to force anyone to come to school. If a family chooses not to come in, they now have the ability to opt out. SC parents have never had the ability to opt out, but now they do. Therefore, again, she feels that our participation rate, giving the interim assessment, will be higher. She may be proved wrong, and she hopes so, but this is where we are. It has never been that Superintendent Spearman felt that students should not be assessed. It was that the assessments we had given were very adequate by providing with information at the student/teacher level, but through our RALLY tool at the state level.

Mr. Butzon's comment to Dr. Mathis was that he needs to provide a copy of the book to each member of the SBE stating that there was very valuable information contained in the book, and he encouraged every SBE member to read the book. Mr. Butzon also asked for a copy of the template and the roadmap that Dr. Mathis mentioned in today's literacy update. Dr. Mathis agreed to mail the requested items to the SBE. Mr. Butzon also inquired about the availability of the EA information. Dr. Mathis responded that the districts received their spreadsheets, which contained their data through the winter assessments. The spring assessments will be added and made available to the districts around mid-May. At that point, they will have enough information to encompass the entire year for all three assessments.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Butzon and Dr. Mathis. Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions and recognized Dr. West who asked about the SCDE's response or comments about H. 3613, which wants to increase the testing requirements for teacher education in post-secondary teacher preparation education. Specifically adding another exam focused on the teaching of reading.

Superintendent Spearman responded that that particular piece of legislation was pulled out from the Education Reform Bill that ended up not passing last legislative session. The General Assembly is in the process of breaking down the larger Education Reform Bill into smaller parts. The section you refer to is now H. 3613. When Superintendent Spearman first looked at that bill, she had thought that she could not add another assessment. But, she has done further research, and spoke with people, and looking at what other states are doing that has shown student growth, with students struggling in reading, the addition of the assessment was part of their model for

teacher candidates for strategies in reading. Earlier, Superintendent Spearman stated that she reluctantly supported the bill; she is not a huge fan of additional assessments for credentialing, but in this case based on what she has discovered and the conversations she has had, she is convinced that her support of H.3613 is appropriate.

Dr. West stated that she appreciated Superintendent Spearman acknowledging the additional testing (unclear). As you know, we have fewer students entering the education preparation programs and the legislature just made the decision to allow anyone with a bachelor's degree in specific areas to fill classroom positions that are still vacant the first five days. All of these pieces, as I know you are aware, are related and there has been, in the past, testing that took place during the first two years of a teacher's career. Maybe the state would consider looking at such an assessment to take place at that point and to provide funding for districts to assist educators. Just a thought from a person in a position working at higher education.

Superintendent Spearman thanked Dr. West for her comments, and asked Dr. West to call her to discuss this issue further. She agrees that while we are making it more stringent for candidates going through a four-year program, we are less stringent on others. It is an issue. We continue to hear the cry for more alternative certification programs, I think there still has to be some oversight on that, but she agrees and as you know, she has spoken with the deans and looking at models where we may, on the Praxis, if the assessment can be tracked, to show that we get a better candidate and a more effective teacher, then, Superintendent Spearman thinks it is appropriate. However, as we use these assessments, and the research might show, that it has no impact on helping to identify an effective teacher, then she thinks that we need to rethink it. That is certainly the case with some of the information we are getting on Praxis. Superintendent Spearman stated that she is open to changes and willing to look at it. The question you asked about the reading, the people that she has talked with have convinced her that it did indeed help to ensure that there was a better-prepared teacher in their classrooms. Again, Superintendent Spearman hears and shares Dr. West's concerns about too many assessments, but if the assessments are effective in identifying and helping to identify stronger teachers, she can support it.

Chair Woodall thanked Dr. West and Superintendent Spearman for their comments.

02. Allendale County School District (ASCD) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

- Dr. Gilmore was named the SC Athletic Administrators Association (SCAAA) 3A/2A/1A Superintendent of the Year for 2021 and was recognized at the SCAAA Spring Conference on March 14, 2021.
- The district has planned a summer recovery program for June 21st through July 25th for 4K–12th grades.
- The ASCD Fiscal Year (FY) 2019–2020 Sub recipient Risk Assessment score was a 20, which indicates a medium risk. This score is only 2 points away from low risk and

indicates an increase in sound federal compliance practices. Ms. Mack stated that for FY 2017–18 their score was 30.

03. Florence County School District Four (FCSD-4) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

- Four students completed the welding program at the Continuum and six new students began the pipe welding program on March 29th.
- Of the 33 prospective graduates of Timmonsville High School's class of 2020–21, 31 of them have been accepted into a two or four year college. Ms. Mack stated that they were still working with the last two students.
- The school year will be extended until July 1, 2021, to address the learning gap. This information will be included in their Reading Recovery Plan submission for this year.
- The FCSD-4 FY 2019–2020 Sub recipient Risk Assessment score was a 21, which indicates a medium risk. Ms. Mack stated their previous year's score was 31, which is a high-risk score.

04. Williamsburg County School District (WCSD) Update—Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

- The WCSD Fiscal Year 2019–2020 Sub recipient Risk Assessment score was a 10, which indicates a low risk. The lowest score is a 9. Ms. Mack stated their previous year's score was 18. The WCSD has been in the low risk category for the past two years.
- The WCSD was awarded a US Department of Agriculture Rural Utilities Grant of $840,000.00 to be used for distance learning.

This concluded Ms. Mack's report

Chair Woodall thanked Ms. Mack for her report. Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions and recognized Superintendent Spearman who gave a brief update on the FCSD-4/FCSD-1 consolidation. Superintendent Spearman, last week, named the Transition Team Committee (TTC) consisting of several appointees from each of the communities:

- Mr. Porter Stewart, Chairman, FCSD-1 Board of Trustees;
- Ms. Trisha Caulder, Vice Chair FCSD-1 Board of Trustees;
- Dr. Gloria Bracey, FCSD-4 Family & Community/Medicaid/Adult Education Coordinator, and a minister;
- Mr. Thomas McFadden, Timmonsville Police Chief and the FCSD-4 Timmonsville High School (THS) Football Coach;
- Ms. Kimberly E. Mack, Director, Office of School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement; and
- Ms. Tonya Addison, Executive District Administrator and the Principal of THS, FSCD-4

Superintendent Spearman stated that the TTC will begin meeting to give recommendations on how the transition should be handled. The TTC will not really be governing the consolidation, but will be giving recommendations; acting as a conduit for the community to discuss the community's concerns about the consolidation; and ensuring correct and accurate information is disseminated to the community. Superintendent Spearman asked if there were any questions on the consolidation and the closure of THS.

Chair Woodall thanked Ms. Mack and Superintendent Spearman for their updates.

05. Clarendon School District One (CSD–1) Update—Steven Strother, Finance Director, Office of Finance
As previously stated by Mr. Strother

- the financial management takeover of CSD–1 was approved by the SBE on October 15, 2020;
- David Loadholt, the contract CFO for the SCDE, is working with the SC Retirement System, The IRS, and the SC Department of Revenue to settle the liabilities to those systems (in the amount of roughly $1.3M). These liabilities contributed to the financial management takeover of CSD–1, and have been settled in full.
    - The SC Retirement System liability has been paid in full (approximately $800,000), and is up to date through December 31, 2020.
    - The IRS obligation has been paid in full. (approximately $425,000)
    - The obligation to the SC Department of Revenue had been paid in full. (approximately $125,000)

Mr. Strother's current report stated that

- As of early April, the Tax Anticipation Note has been paid in full ($2.6 Million).
- With the cash-flow information provided by Mr. Loadholt for March 2021, the cash flow deficit at the end of June 30, 2021, is projected to be $230,000.
    - To review, since October 15, 2020, the ongoing cash flow projection started with a $2.3M deficit;
        - which was reduced to $1.9M (November 10, 2020 SBE Minutes);
        - which was reduced to $1.7M (December 8, 2020 SBE Minutes);
        - which was reduced to $1.1M (January 12, 2021 SBE Minutes);
        - which was reduced to $408,000 (February 9, 2021 SBE Minutes);
        - which was reduced to $153,000 (March 9, 2021 SBE Minutes); and
        - as of today's meeting we are currently back up to $230,000. Mr. Strother's went on to say that, some of the differences might include projected amounts as opposed to actual amounts that they will receive at the end of April. He further explained that the increase from $153,000 to $230,000 also comes from invoices that Mr. Loadholt is unaware of until the vendors call wanting their payments. Even though there is a spending

freeze, those vendors, who prior to the financial takeover, provided services still have to be paid. Mr. Strother reminded everyone that over a six-month period, the amount has dropped from $2.3M to approximately $230,000.

- The Spending Freeze remains in effect, reducing Accounts Payable costs.
- Open positions are not being filled. Some of the open positions where savings have occurred include:
    - The Assistant Superintendent of Special Services retired November30. CSD-3 is covering the services for a stipend from CSD-1.
    - Transportation between the two districts was consolidated as of January 1, 2021.
    - A vacant HR position remains un-filled with the Human Resource duties being handled by CSD-4.
    - A Medicaid clerk position became open, and will not be filled, and duties are being handled through shared services.
    - A music Teacher position became open, and CSD-2 is sharing those services so that band students can continue to receive instruction.
    - The CSD-1 Superintendent will be furloughed the last 10 days of June.
- The SCDE, with assistance of Mr. Loadholt, has identified expenses that can be shifted from the general fund to the CARES/ ESSER funds received by the district.
- Measures to help reduce the deficit are continually being discussed.
- The SCDE Finance Office (FO) has representatives onsite in CSD-1, one day per week to assist with entering and approving federal budgets and the filing of federal claims.
- The SCDE-FO is assisting with assuring the Annual Audit for FY20 is completed.
- The CSD-1 Board of Trustees is being updated monthly on the financial condition of the district.
- The SBE is being updated monthly on the financial condition of the district.

This concluded Mr. Strother's report.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Strother's for his report. Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions and recognized Mr. Butzon who stated that there have been some miraculous things happening in turning over this deficit in CSD-1. Mr. Butzon asked if anyone had an idea of what cost of this is going to be, and he is not just speaking about the financial cost, he is talking about the price that children are going to pay for the jobs that are not filled; materials that are not purchased, etc. Mr. Strother stated that some of the jobs are being handled with shared services from the other Clarendon districts. He stated that the stop of purchases were probably classroom supplies, but where we can see that those are legitimate purchases through federal funds, we will allow those purchases to be made. Hopefully, those purchases can be kept to a minimum. Mr. Butzon asked if we would continue with the shared services model through the consolidation. Superintendent Spearman responded that beginning July 1, 2021, CSD-1 will be consolidated with CSD-3 (Summerton/Turbeville area) to create the new CSD-4 and both CSD-1 & CSD-3 will cease to exist. CSD-4 has been established, Dr. Angela Baines is serving as the interim district superintendent and, currently, there is work going on in CSD-4. There will be shared services in the new CSD-4. She stated that Senator Kevin Johnson, who represents that

area, was able to get legislation passed to consolidate CSD-2 into the new CSD-4 on July 1, 2022, which will consolidate the former four districts into one countywide CSD. We have done everything possible to make sure that the instruction for the students is improved, and students have supplies.

Chair Woodall thanked Mr. Butzon, Mr. Strother, and Superintendent Spearman for their comments.

06. Quarterly Review of State Board of Education's Fiscal Year 2020–21 Budget—
Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Financial Office
Mrs. Williams indicated that she would send the virtual members a copy of the budget after today's meeting. Mrs. Williams stated that the SBE's yearly budget is $58,034 and through the quarter ending on March 31, 2021, the SBE has spent approximately $25,944 (45 percent) on teacher cases and operating expenses (i.e., parking meter costs, travel, etc.). When the outstanding encumbrances for those two categories are added into the operational costs, the amount rises to $41,032 (71 percent). So far, your budget is good shape and she will continue to monitor the budget for the remaining FY and make any adjustments, as necessary.

Chair Woodall thanked Mrs. Williams's for her review. Chair Woodall asked if there were any comments or questions.

Ms. Hazelwood stated that Educator Services also provides additional funding to the SBE to assist with the cost of hearing officers and court reporting services on teacher cases. Ms. Hazelwood wanted the SBE to be aware that Educator Services was providing financial assistance with that expenditure but because it comes from the budget for Educator Services, those expenditures do not appear on the SBE's budget.

XII. OTHER BUSINESS

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:07 p.m.