

MINUTES

State Board of Education Meeting

Date

March 10, 2020

Time

1:00 p.m.

Location

**Rutledge Conference Center
1429 Senate Street
Columbia, SC 29201**

Michael Brennan, Chair

Dr. Kristi Woodall, Chair-Elect

Molly M. Spearman

State Superintendent of Education

Secretary and Administrative Officer to the Board

I. WELCOME

The State Board of Education (SBE) meeting convened at 1:00 p.m. Chair Brennan, Governor's Appointee, stated there was a quorum and called the meeting to order.

The following SBE members were in attendance: Chair-Elect Dr. Kristi Woodall, Sixteenth Judicial Circuit; Jon Butzon, First Judicial Circuit; Crystal Stapleton, Second Judicial Circuit; Dr. Shawn Johnson, Third Judicial Circuit; Cathy D. Chapman, Fourth Judicial Circuit; Dr. Tracy West, Fifth Judicial Circuit; Carl Hinze, Seventh Judicial Circuit; Cynthia A. Downs, Ed.D., Eighth Judicial Circuit; Larry Kobrovsky, Ninth Judicial Circuit; Debby Howard, Tenth Judicial Circuit; Steven English, Eleventh Judicial Circuit; Jean W. Pearson, Twelfth Judicial Circuit; David Whittemore, Thirteenth Judicial Circuit; and Alan Walters, Fifteenth Judicial Circuit.

J.R. Green, PhD, Sixth Judicial Circuit arrived late and Valaree C. Smith, Fourteenth Judicial Circuit did not attend.

The following South Carolina Department of Education (SCDE) staff were in attendance: Molly M. Spearman, State Superintendent of Education; Cathy Hazelwood, Deputy Superintendent and Parliamentarian, Division for Legal Affairs; John Payne, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement; Elizabeth Jones, Director, Office of Assessment, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement; Donna Manning, Interim Director, School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement; Karla McLawhorn Hawkins, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Educator, Community and Federal Resources; Mary Hipp, Director, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources; Alicia Gaither, Education Associate, Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community and Federal Resources; Nancy Williams, Chief Financial Officer, Office of Finance; David Mathis, Ed.D., Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness;

Quincie Moore, Director, Office of Early Learning & Literacy, Division of College and Career Readiness; Betsy Carpentier, Deputy Superintendent, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Laurie Traywick, Administrative Coordinator, Superintendent's Office; Barbara A. Drayton, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Scott Winburn, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Henry Gunter, Deputy General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Holly Hadden, Assistant General Counsel, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Jordan McWilliams, Law Clerk, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Julie Anne Castro, Law Clerk, Office of General Counsel, Division for Legal Affairs; Jennifer Austin, Administrative Assistant, Office of Governmental Affairs, Division for Legal Affairs; Travis Huggins, Information Technology Manager I, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Lewis Chambers, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; Quinn Murphy, IT Specialist III, Service and Support Center, Division of Data, Technology and Agency Operations; and Noelle Redd, Minutes Taker, Division for Legal Affairs.

Chair Brenan welcomed the C. E. Murray High School JROTC, from the town of Greeleyville located in Williamsburg County. They performed the Posting of the Colors. Chair Brenan thanked LTC Anthony Hughes and his team for their presentation. Chair Brenan thanked Chair-Elect Woodall for leading everyone in the Pledge of Allegiance.

II. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 11, 2020

Chair Brenan asked if there were any objections to approving the minutes as presented for the SBE meeting on February 11, 2020. Hearing no objections, the minutes were approved by unanimous consent.

III. APPROVAL OF STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AGENDA FOR MARCH 10, 2020

Chair Brenan asked if there were any objections to approving the agenda as presented for the March 10, 2020, SBE meeting. Hearing no objections, the agenda was approved by unanimous consent.

IV. RECOGNITION OF VISITORS, INCLUDING NEWS MEDIA

The following visitors were present:

- Jeremy Darby, Principal, Campobello Gramling School, Spartanburg County School District;
- Karis Mazyck, Principal, Blythewood Middle School, Richland County School District Two;
- Sean Bishton, Principal, Muller Road Middle School, Richland County School District Two;
- Jen Meisten, Principal, Beck Academy, Greenville County School District;
- Mary Leslie Anderson, Principal, League Academy of Communication Arts, Greenville County School District;
- Chad Maguire, Principal, Sevier Middle School, Greenville County School District;
- Jason McCauley, Principal, Palmetto Middle School, Anderson School District One;
- Deedee Westwood, Principal, Mid-Carolina Middle School, Newberry County School District;
- Angela Burns, Principal, Crayton Middle School, Richland County School District One;
- Cynthia L. Robinson, Principal, Castle Heights Middle School, Rock Hill School District Three of York County;
- Anna Miller, Principal, Chapin Middle School, Lexington County School District One;

- Sharah Clark, Principal, Batesburg-Leesville Middle School, Lexington County School District Three;
- Ingrid Dukes, Principal, College Park Middle School, Berkeley County School District;
- Dr. Baron Davis, Superintendent, Richland County School District Two;
- Alison Whisenant, Curriculum Specialist, Muller Road Middle School, Richland County School District Two;
- Jim Suber, Superintendent, Newberry County School District;
- Dr. Henry Cobb, Executive Director of Schools, Richland County School District One;
- Michael Guliano, Chief Instructional Officer, Lexington County School District One; and
- Angela Rye, Chief Academic Officer, Lexington County School District Three.

No news media were present.

V. STATE BOARD CHAIR REPORT

No report.

VI. STATE SUPERINTENDENT OF EDUCATION REPORT

Superintendent Spearman welcomed everyone to the meeting and let the audience know that the JROTC was from Williamsburg School District and was one of the counties that the SCDE was managing. She stated that the cadets did a wonderful job and she thanked Dr. Wilder for the wonderful job she has been doing in Williamsburg.

Superintendent Spearman provided an update of what the SCDE; Department of Health and Environmental Control (DHEC); South Carolina Emergency Preparedness (SCEMP); the Governor's Office; and other state and federal partners have been doing with the school districts regarding the novel coronavirus (COVID-19). We have spent a lot of time working to ensure that we get good, factual information out to the school districts and schools so they can make the best decisions. COVID-19 is very different from anything we have dealt with in the past. The decisions to close schools and cancel events has always been at the local level. However, because this is a health crisis, we need to operate a little differently. Yesterday, Superintendent Spearman sent out communications to the school districts asking the local superintendents to defer any decisions to close their schools until they contact her so that she can contact the appropriate person at DHEC and together they would all make the decision to close schools. Currently, things are going well. We have learned from the media that cases have been identified in SC and there are test kits available at the labs. There has been some confusion as to if doctors have these test kits, and our understanding is that the doctors will swab a patient, secure and package the swab and send it to the lab for results. Labs will only receive swabs from doctor offices. She stated that so far, fifty people in the state had been tested. The public needs to remain as calm as possible during this crisis. According to the medical profession, a person would be better off getting this virus as opposed to catching the flu. However, there are certain segments of the population that will be affected more than the rest of the population. Ryan Brown is my representative at the SCEMP and Superintendent Spearman is taking phone calls and working closely with the Governor's Office and the head of DHEC. She hopes that things will calm down and soon get back to normal. The SCDE is sending out directives to schools districts. One of the questions from superintendents, when she met with them, was what would happen if the schools had to close; what are they allowed to do and what will count as instruction. Currently, there are fifteen districts that are part of an e-learning program pilot. There are certain criteria to get into that program, you have to indicate the number of devices you have available and teacher training. Those fifteen schools can do that, and are sending out guidance information to those district offices to be prepared incase schools are shut down with at least two weeks of instructional work which will be sent home

with each student. The rest of the schools need to be prepared to work with pencil and paper. The SCDE will go to the legislature, at the appropriate time, to ask for whatever coverage we need. She feels that it would be impossible to predict past the two weeks of instructional materials and what else would be required. We are working with districts and advising them to make those type plans in case this crisis rises to that level.

Superintendent Spearman offered to answer any questions from the audience. There being none, Superintendent Spearman reminded the audience to wash their hands, use hand sanitizer, cough and sneeze into your arm, and stay home if you are sick. The SCDE has been getting questions from parents about pulling their children out of school and if it would be an excused absence. They have been told to no, they need to provide a doctor's note. The Medical University of South Carolina (MUSC) is the only location in the nation offering free, online Skype, telemedicine visits to the residents of SC. In the past 24 hours, they have provided free telemedicine to over 700 citizens. The site will be posted on the SCDE's website.

Today, we are also holding a special recognition for the outstanding educators that are visiting and in our audience. Leaders who are principals, assistant principals, superintendents, or district administrators in our state. They are part of the National Recognition of School to Watch Initiative. This is a middle school recognition and there are 37 criteria that the schools have to meet. Some of the criteria are

- academic excellence;
- social and emotional health of the students; and
- support structure with shared leadership; etc.

These leaders are recognized for a three-year period and they can reapply again for the recognition. Twenty schools have received this designation.

Superintendent Spearman recognized the following:

- Jeremy Darby, Principal, Campobello Gramling School, Spartanburg County School District along with SBE member Carl Hinze;
- Karis Mazyck, Principal, Blythewood Middle School, Richland County School District Two along with SBE member Dr. Tracy West;
- Sean Bishton, Principal, Muller Road Middle School, Richland County School District Two along with SBE member Dr. Tracy West;
- Jen Meisten, Principal, Beck Academy, Greenville County School District along with SBE member David Whittemore;
- Mary Leslie Anderson, Principal, League Academy of Communication Arts, Greenville County School District along with SBE member David Whittemore;
- Chad Maguire, Principal, Sevier Middle School, Greenville County School District along with SBE member David Whittemore;
- Jason McCauley, Principal, Palmetto Middle School, Anderson School District One along with SBE member Mrs. Debbie Howard;
- Deedee Westwood, Principal, Mid-Carolina Middle School, Newberry County School District along with SBE member Dr. Cynthia Downs;
- Anna Miller, Principal, Chapin Middle School, Lexington County School District One along with SBE member Steve English;
- Sharah Clark, Principal, Batesburg-Leesville Middle School, Lexington County School District Three along with SBE member Steve English;
- Cynthia L. Robinson, Principal, Castle Heights Middle School, Rock Hill School District Three of York County along with SBE member, Chair-Elect, Dr. Kristi Woodall;

- Angela Burns, Principal, Crayton Middle School, Richland County School District One along with SBE member Dr. Tracy West; and
- Ingrid Dukes, Principal, College Park Middle School, Berkeley County School District; along with SBE member Larry Kobrovsky.

Superintendent Spearman stated that you could not have a great school without a great principal. She thanked the principals for their great work, especially with middle school students.

This concluded the Superintendent's report.

Chair Brennan asked that Superintendent Spearman give an update on the Education Reform Bill, S. 419 (S. 419).

Superintendent Spearman stated that S. 419 passed in the Senate last week, and the House is currently debating the budget, so she is not sure exactly what will happen. The House members need to hear the bill on the floor, and will probably make a quick decision not to confer on that bill and hopefully send it to committee. We are not sure what their next procedure will be, but soon it will be going the conference committee. There are some similarities in the two bills, but there are also many differences, so there is a great deal of work that needs to be done by the conference committee. Superintendent Spearman asked if there were any questions. There were no questions.

Chair Brennan thanked Superintendent Spearman for her report.

VII. PARLIAMENTARIAN COMMENTS

Chair Brennan recognized Ms. Hazelwood.

Ms. Hazelwood stated that she had two items for discussion.

1. Everyone has filed their Economic Interest paperwork with the Ethics Commission with the exception of one person. Ms. Hazelwood thanked everyone for completing their forms and promised she would not pester them again until next year.
2. Teacher cases processed through her office for July 1–February 29, 2020
 - a. spent \$26,000 on cases (there are cases pending for March–June) and
 - b. have 160 pending teacher cases.

Ms. Hazelwood stated that Henry Gunter and his team are constantly scheduling cases to bring our docket down. At today's meeting, the SBE decided on almost twenty cases, which will bring the docket number down, but weekly, we get at least one teacher case, if not more.

Chair Brennan recognized Mr. Butzon.

Mr. Butzon asked if the SBE sees all of the teacher cases that Mr. Gunter receives. Ms. Hazelwood stated that a small percentage of cases are dismissed or receive a "Letter of Concern" (LOC) or a "Serious LOC" because they do not quite rise to the concern of a Public Reprimand (PR). Anything that is a PR or above is presented to the SBE for action and the SBE also reviews all Consent Orders. Mr. Butzon requested the number of adjudicated cases to date. Ms. Hazelwood did not have those numbers with her and assured the SBE that she would provide the information.

Chair Brennan recognized Superintendent Spearman.

Superintendent Spearman stated that this issue came before the Senate Finance Committee (SFC) this week and the SFC asked if those were all unprofessional conduct (UP) and that she understands there are different levels of UP. Ms. Hazelwood stated a breach of contract (BC) is considered an UP, and that almost forty of the 160 cases are BCs and the rest are for truly, unprofessional conduct. Mr. Butzon asked Ms. Hazelwood if she could let them know how this year's cases compares to cases in previous years and show what the trend is for the cases. Ms. Hazelwood stated she would provide the information. Mr. Butzon also requested that data be disaggregated. Chair Brennan stated that he has been the Governor's Appointee for twenty years and in that time; the amount has grown every year, particularly those cases that come before the SBE. Chair Brennan stated that in his early years with the SBE, it was rare that cases came before the Full Board, and now, every month, there is at least one case before the Full Board. Mr. Butzon stated that the increase poses an interesting question as to why and what is going on that is causing the cases are increasing, given the fact that we are maintaining a teacher shortage, etc., Mr. Butzon feels that we are only addressing part of the issue. Chair Brennan thanked Mr. Butzon for a great question. Superintendent Spearman commented that it is important for us to have these types of conversations. She stated that she had been with the SCDE, off and on, for a long time. She was here in the 1990's and during that time, the SCDE felt the need to hire an investigator, and districts were required to report teacher misconduct to the SCDE, and the districts do, but, if by chance a district did not report a teacher to us, we have an investigator who watches newspapers, and police reports, so that those teachers don't slip through the cracks. That is one part, and in speaking with Ms. Hazelwood, there are more and more BCs where a teacher signs a contract, at the beginning of the year, and does not show up, or they transfer to another district, which is serious but does not seem to be taken as seriously as it used to be. Superintendent Spearman stated that she appreciates the good work done by Ms. Hazelwood's Office of General Counsel and she wants everyone to understand that as the State Superintendent of Education, she is not allowed to get involved with teacher disciplinary cases. It is better to do it this way because it prevents her and anyone else from getting personally involved in a particular case. Ms. Hazelwood informed the SBE members that if someone talks to, or sends written information to an SBE member requesting help on a teacher's case, that is what the law refers to as an ex parte communication, and the SBE member must recuse themselves from voting on the case.

This concluded the Parliamentarian's comments.

Chair Brennan thanked Ms. Hazelwood for her comments.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

IX. STATE BOARD ITEMS

PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Brennan reported that the committee did not meet.

This concluded Chair Brennan's report.

FOR APPROVAL

No meeting.

EP EDUCATION PROFESSIONS—COMMITTEE REPORT

Chair Brennan recognized Mrs. Pearson who reported that the committee met and heard four action items and one information item. The four action items were placed on the Consent Agenda.

This concluded Mrs. Pearson's report.

FOR APPROVAL

01. Program Modification: Bachelor of Arts (BA) in Middle-level Education at the University of South Carolina–Upstate (UofSC–Upstate)—Clay Barton, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

02. New Educator Preparation Program Approval Recommendation: Alternative Pathways for Educator Certification (APEC) Program at Columbia College—Clay Barton, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

03. Approval of District Assisting, Developing, and Evaluating Professional Teaching (ADEPT) Plans—Lilla Toal-Mandsager, Director, Office of Educator, Effectiveness and Leadership Development, Division of Educator, Community and Federal Resources

04. South Carolina Educator Preparation Guidelines: Standards, Policies, and Procedures *Emergency Provisions for Clinical Experience (Student Teaching) Requirements*—Mary Hipp, Director, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

FOR INFORMATION

05. Annual Report on Individuals Certified through the American Board for the Certification of Teacher Excellence (American Board)—Alicia Gaither, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

Ms. Gaither stated that in 2007 the SC General Assembly passed the American Board for the Certification of Teacher Excellence Act (American Board). The Act allows school districts to hire individuals who have received a Passport certificate issued by the American Board, an alternative route preparation provider, and who met requirements of the legislation in the content areas of biology, chemistry, English, mathematics, physics, and science in middle and secondary levels.

Per state statute, the SCDE must submit this report, annually, to the General Assembly and the SBE no later than March 31, 2020. The report presents employment and performance evaluation data for American Board candidates issued an alternate route certificate during the 2018–19 academic year.

The report she submits today contains three-year data for the number of American Board certificates issued by the certification area; by district; and evaluation data, to include the 2019–20 school year. There are ninety-five American Board certified educators employed in thirty-six SC districts; and twenty-one American Board educators advanced from an alternative certificate to a professional standard certificate following the 2018–19

school year.

Chair Brennan asked if there were questions. Chair Brennan acknowledged Mr. Butzon.

Mr. Butzon asked if Ms. Gaither had any information or data that would compare the effectiveness of the American Board certified teachers with teachers that come from a more traditional pathway. Ms. Gaither stated that the report she was presenting did not have that information. Mr. Butzon asked if they had it in another report. Ms. Gaither stated that she would need to confirm with Ms. Hipp if that data could be collected from the other alternative route programs and prepare something for the SBE. Mrs. Hipp stated that this report does have the ADEPT Evaluation results for the American Board educators, so you can see the success rates of those educators comparable to traditional pathways. Mr. Butzon thanked Ms. Gaither.

Chair Brennan thanked Ms. Gaither for her report.

Chair Brennan thanked Mrs. Pearson for her report and stated that the SBE had the recommendations from the EP Committee to place Items EP-01–EP-04 on the consent agenda, therefore since the recommendation comes from the EP Committee, it does not require a second. Chair Brennan asked for a vote, the item passed.

SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY

Chair Brennan recognized Ms. Howard who reported that the committee met and heard one approval item and there were no items for information.

This concluded Ms. Howard's report.

FOR APPROVAL

01. Appointment Recommendations for the 2020 Instructional Materials Review Panels—Ms. Kriss Stewart, Program Coordinator, Instructional Materials Adoption Program, Chief Operating Office

FOR INFORMATION

None.

Chair Brennan thanked Mrs. Howard for her report and stated that the SBE had the recommendation from the SLA Committee to place Item SLA-01 on the consent agenda, therefore since the recommendation comes from the SLA Committee, it does not require a second. Chair Brennan asked for a vote, the item passed.

ELC EDUCATOR LICENSURE—COMMITTEE REPORT

Mrs. Chapman presented the Educator Licensure Committee (ELC) report. Mrs. Chapman stated that the committee met and took action on thirteen cases, which consisted of three Public Reprimands and ten Suspensions.

Chair Brennan thanked Mrs. Chapman for her report and stated that the SBE has reviewed those cases and have the recommendations from the ELC Committee, therefore since the recommendation comes from the ELC Committee, it does not require a second. Chair Brennan asked for a vote, fifteen ayes, one nay, and motion passed.

Chair Brennan stated that the FB-ELC met at 11:00 a.m. and approved the ELC report.

FB-ELC FULL BOARD EDUCATOR LICENSURE–COMMITTEE REPORT

The FB-ELC met and took action on four cases; two Suspensions; one Consent Order of Permanent Voluntary Revocation; and one Revocation. Chair Brennan stated that this matter was ratified by the FB-ELC.

X. CONSENT AGENDA

Chair Brennan called for the vote for approval of all items on the consent agenda.

Dr. Johnson made the motion to approve all items on the consent agenda. Mr. Kobrovsky seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Brennan opened the floor for discussions, there being none, Chair Brennan called for a vote. The members unanimously voted to approve the consent agenda.

PL POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

FOR APPROVAL

No meeting.

EP EDUCATOR PROFESSIONS—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

FOR APPROVAL

01. Program Modification: Bachelor of Arts (BA) in Middle-level Education at the University of South Carolina–Upstate (UofSC–Upstate)—Clay Barton, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

02. New Educator Preparation Program Approval Recommendation: Alternative Pathways for Educator Certification (APEC) Program at Columbia College—Clay Barton, Education Associate, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

03. Approval of District Assisting, Developing, and Evaluating Professional Teaching (ADEPT) Plans—Lilla Toal-Mandsager, Director, Office of Educator, Effectiveness and Leadership Development, Division of Educator, Community and Federal Resources

04. South Carolina Educator Preparation Guidelines: Standards, Policies, and Procedures *Emergency Provisions for Clinical Experience (Student Teaching) Requirements*—Mary Hipp, Director, Office of Educator Services, Division of Educator, Community, and Federal Resources

SLA STANDARDS, LEARNING AND ACCOUNTABILITY—CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

FOR APPROVAL

01. Appointment Recommendations for the 2020 Instructional Materials Review Panels—Ms. Kriss Stewart, Program Coordinator, Instructional Materials Adoption Program, Chief Operating Office

SBE SOUTH CAROLINA BOARD OF EDUCATION REPORT

FOR APPROVAL

01. Proposed Amendment of the State Board of Education (SBE) Rules of Governance (Rules), Policy BBBE-E (Policy BBBE-E), State Board of Education Budget Guidelines and General Rules for Reimbursement (Last Amendment June 14, 2006) (First Reading)—Cathy Hazelwood, Deputy Superintendent for Legal Affairs/Parliamentarian, Division for Legal Affairs

Ms. Hazelwood presented the proposed amendments to the SBE Rules, Policy BBBE-E, State Board of Education Budget Guidelines and General Rules for Reimbursement. This updates the Rule to reflect the actual internal processes as well as changes from the Comptroller General. Ms. Hazelwood also stated that if there were a two-thirds vote by the SBE, then the proposed amendments would not need to come back to the SBE for a second reading.

Today's request is to realign this policy with the technological changes that have occurred since this policy was last updated in 2006. Below are some of the changes

- No long distance phone calls—deleted, everyone now using cell phones;
- Printing and mailing of agenda items—replaced with electronic transmission of the agendas, etc.;
- Meals (circa, 1985)—Daily Minimum Allowance has been increased by \$10 for in-state meals and \$18 for out-of-state travel; and
- Lodging from a maximum of \$85 to \$113 per night, including taxes.

Ms. Hazelwood requested a two-thirds vote by the members to avoid bringing this item back in April for a second reading.

Chair Brennan called for a motion to amend SBE Rules, Policy BBBE-E, State Board of Education Budget Guidelines and General Rules for Reimbursement.

Mrs. Howard made the Motion. Mr. Kobrovsky seconded the Motion.

Chair Brennan opened the floor for discussions, there being none, Chair Brennan called for a vote. The members unanimously voted to amend SBE Rules, Policy BBBE-E, State Board of Education Budget Guidelines and General Rules for Reimbursement. No second reading required.

02. Orangeburg County School District (District) Online Testing Waiver Requests of General Appropriations Act, 2018, S.C. Act 97, Proviso 1.76 (Proviso 1.76), SDE: Technical Assistance—Elizabeth Jones, Director, Federal Programs, Office of Assessment, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability and School Improvement

Mrs. Jones presented the District's online testing waiver request to the full board for approval. This request is for one school in Orangeburg County that bought new devices and they are having trouble with those devices. This request came in on February 13, 2020, two days after our last board meeting, so the SCDE is requesting approval to grant the online testing waiver for that school for their SC READY; ELA; SC Science; and math tests with pencil and paper.

Chair Brennan stated that the SBE was hearing this item because the PL Committee did not meet today.

Mrs. Howard made the Motion. Mr. Kobrovsky seconded the Motion.

Chair Brennan opened the floor for discussions. Chair Brennan recognized Mr. Butzon.

Mr. Butzon stated that he has raised this issue before concerning the large amount of online testing waivers the SBE hands out. He feels that we are about to get a lesson on why we really want to do better educationally using computers, if we cannot go to school, for whatever reason. Superintendent Spearman made a report about it earlier in the meeting. Mr. Butzon feels that the SBE is not doing anyone a big favor, and he understands that this is a one-time thing because the school has some new toys and they do not know how to play with them, yet, but they are going to learn. There are still lots of places out there where education is not making any progress in learning how to use the computer, and in this case, for testing. He would just ask that we think about the bigger long-term picture of having computers help us with testing and the delivery of services.

Chair Brennan thanked Mr. Butzon for his comments and asked if there was any discussion.

Chair Butzon recognized Dr. Green.

Dr. Green asked where we were as it relates to testing waivers, now, in terms of the number of schools and districts. Mrs. Jones did not have the numbers with her, but thought it was 37 or 38 districts that have made a request for some or all grades, or some or all schools. Mrs. Jones indicated that she does have the test by subject matter and some of the district requests overlap subject matter:

- science—10 districts;
- math—15 districts;
- ELA—23 districts requesting waivers for younger children whose smaller sized hands cannot operate a keyboard; and
- English Language Proficient (ELP)—18 districts requesting waivers for student's having to speak into microphones for proficiency of language and listening on headsets.

Chair Brennan thanked Mrs. Jones for her report and asked if there was any more discussion. There being none, Chair Brennan called for a vote. The members unanimously voted to grant the District's waiver request.

FOR INFORMATION

03. Literacy Update—David Mathis, EdD, Deputy Superintendent, Division of College and Career Readiness

Superintendent Spearman asked that Dr. Mathis give a quick update on literacy within our state.

Beginning with our youngest learners, 4K students. You are familiar with the Governor's proposal is to take the Child Early Reading and Development Education Program (CERDEP) program to public and private schools statewide for any student who is Medicaid eligible or those who have a family income of 185 percent or less than the federal poverty level. This expansion to those districts would include another seventeen additional districts, if we go statewide. Currently, CERDEP is serving students in districts who have a poverty level of 70 percent or higher. This expansion includes the private schools and private centers could qualify for the expansion. The private centers are approved by First Steps. Currently, our schools are examining the

possibilities and the space they have for expansion. One of the biggest elements of the expansion is for the Department of Social Services (DSS) CERDEP regulations to be suspended. DSS's strict regulations affect only the 4K CERDEP classrooms but the SCDE's requirements, state building codes, and teaching qualification regulations address all classrooms, including 4K.

Dr. Mathis gave an update on the Multi-Tiered Systems of Support (MTSS). The Learning Disorders Task Force (LDTF) met on February 25, 2020, to review the list of vendors that screen students in grades K–2 for reading difficulties. In 2019, the vendors list was approved late, causing districts to find out late who was listed. For this reason, waivers were allowed for this year only to districts who met the criteria. Dr. Mathis explained the waiver approval process and reported that the SCDE received 59 waiver requests, more than anticipated. During a showcase in January, the SCDE realized some of the information presented by current approved screeners was dated. The LDTF and OELL decided to review those screeners and potential new screeners to confirm whether they meet current criteria. There are now 10 approved screeners on the list, one of which is free. Two other screeners need to provide more information to be approved. The districts have to choose one of the approved screeners to use since waivers to use other screeners will not be approved. Dr. Mathis emphasizes the importance of using the results of the screening to help measure students' growth. He also expressed concern with when kindergarten students are screened. Dr. Mathis provided information on the Kindergarten Readiness Assessment.

Dr. Mathis reported on Mandatory Third Grade Retention Legislation Act 284 that is being considered in the SC House of Representatives and the SC Senate. In the past, retention of third-grade students in SC scoring in the equivalent to Not Met 1 on the reading portion of SC READY was about 6,000. The proposed legislation would take mandatory retention to all third- graders who score in the Does Not Meet category of English language Arts (ELA). If new legislation passes to include first and second grade students, these 6,000 students could increase to approximately 14,000. If passed, implementation will begin in the summer of 2021. School districts are concerned about funding needed to provide summer reading programs to more students. Mr. Butzon spoke to the importance of early detection of and effective intervention for students struggling to read. Dr. Mathis shared how this approach could work. Dr. Mathis shared his thoughts on DSS's regulations as it pertains to quality teaching and how the change will make teachers stronger and more effective. He also mentioned the importance of parental involvement, DSS assistance, and Department of Health and Environmental Control assistance before children enter 4K.

Dr. Mathis reported on the Reading Coach Proviso and the pending legislation. Currently, there is a proviso passed late last year that gives the SCDE the authority to approve the reading coaches in about 230 schools that have one-third or more of their third-grade students in the Does Not Meet category on ELA. The SCDE has identified those schools and informed the Palmetto Literacy Project and literacy coaches who have been working with the schools for the past couple of years. Pending legislation gives the SCDE the authority to hire the coaches in those schools. Superintendent Spearman sent out a memo explaining if this legislation passes, districts, other than those with one or more of the 512 schools having less than one-third of its third graders in the Does Not meet category, have the discretion to use the funding, that decreases each year, to fund a reading coach or an interventionist, which ever better meets their needs. If a district's literacy program is doing well and they would benefit more from funding professional development, they can use the funds to do so. For the one-third of schools with 49.9 percent of third graders scoring Does Not Meet on the 2019 SC READY ELA, the SCDE will contact the districts and inform them whether they have been approved. The SCDE will work with the schools on their concerns. For 65 of the 230 schools with 50 percent or more in Does Not Meet category, the reading coach will have to reapply for the position. The SCDE will interview and possibly hire them as state employees. The coaches will be evaluated and trained by the SCDE. Districts have expressed that they need and want help and support the program. Initially, the funding for a reading coach was \$65,000 per year but as the number of schools increase each year, the funding amount decreases. This year it is at \$53,000 not including

benefits. Therefore, districts will have to fund the rest. Schools that are not part of the 230 schools are also welcome to participate in the training with the SCDE. Dr. Mathis emphasized higher education students who want to teach need to graduate with an extensive knowledge of how to teach reading.

Dr. Mathis reported on legislation that gave Superintendent Spearman the authority to appoint a State Reading Panel. The panel will include district practitioners, a SBE representative, and higher education representatives. The goal is to discuss and offer advice for a state model for literacy, curriculum needs, assessment needs, data to be collected, and impactful professional learning. They will decide what the SCDE can provide to districts with students most at risk for below-level reading and what the pre-service requirements to influence higher education will be. Mr. Butzon mentioned a report that ranked the states and a discussion on how well teacher training institutions taught the science of reading began. Dr. Mathis stated the SCDE works with Regional Educational Laboratory Southeast on the training programs.

That concluded Dr. Mathis's report.

Chair Brennan thanked Dr. Mathis, and recognized Superintendent Spearman.

Superintendent Spearman has heard from several local superintendents asking why this needs to be done. According to Superintendent Spearman, the state has invested over 300 million dollars on Read2Succeed, and frankly, we really have nothing to show for it, as far as changes in our reading progress and the reading level of our students, and we must do something about the situation; try something different. Some districts have asked for some of these changes such as hiring interventionists if that is what our schools need. The concentration on the lowest performing school with 50 percent of their children at Not Met means we need to try something different to try to get more intense special development; more intense instructional strategies in the classrooms; and she feels that combined with the summer reading camp change; finding some money, hopefully from the Senate, to put new teeth into Read2Succeed; and she is looking into what other states are doing, such as the District of Columbia; Louisiana; Mississippi; where they have had a little more success than we have had. A more direct approach on training teachers, working with teachers, and hiring teaching coaches at every school. The SCDE is tweaking the process, but there had to be full implementation of the current program before we could try something different. Some people are upset with the changes to the program, some people are okay with, and some are excited. We hope to see some better results.

Chair Brennan thanked Superintendent Spearman, and recognized Mr. Butzon.

Mr. Butzon stated he was impressed with the Mississippi State Superintendent, and how she expressed what they had done there in terms of implementing efforts for teaching people how to teach reading. They had many good ideas. Superintendent Spearman stated that some of the strategies mentioned by Dr. Mathis today have come from other states. She stated that we listened and we are going to try it.

Mr. Butzon stated that if a third grader receives a Not Met and repeats the third grade, he then asked what would happen if a student doesn't meet the standard the second year, do they repeat the third grade again? Dr. Mathis responded that if he were the superintendent over that school, he would have to determine if retention would make a difference for that student and whether the student goes on or not, there is an intervention that needs to occur for that student. Mr. Butzon asked if the SCDE was still working on that, to which Dr. Mathis responded, yes and then went on to say we can all argue the value of retention or not, but it has got to benefit the student. The most important thing for that student, at that point, who is below grade level, is the quality of the intervention he receives, and that is an area that we need some work on, one size does not fit all. The intervention needs to be personalized for their specific needs.

Mr. Butzon asked if Dr. Mathis would do this update monthly for the SBE. Dr. Mathis stated yes, on a focused area instead of the broad update that was presented today.

Chair Brennan thanked Mr. Butzon, and recognized Dr. West.

Dr. West asked if the list of approved screeners was available online, Dr. Mathis stated it was available online. Dr. West stated that she is very interested in the MTSS and would like to receive any available information the SCDE has on MTSS. Dr. West stated that she knows from research and what has been seen with intense intervention that MTSS is what is needed. She knows that the establishment of the reading panel compilation will determine and make sure that we have people who are well versed and trained in that area. As we look at the competencies, Dr. West feels that moving away from it; having a three hour class; and having more skill-based competencies is where we need to be looking. Dr. West again appreciates the reading panel, and wanting to make a point of how important it would be to include that topic.

Dr. Mathis stated that he forgot to mention that there is one screener on the list, that by law has to be free of charge, and we do have one screener that is on the list at no charge.

Superintendent Spearman wanted to respond to the comments by Mr. Butzon and Dr. West. She feels that it is important for the SBE and she would like more input from the SBE. There are many experts on the SBE who know about what we are doing; what you think about it; your questions and comments. This is one reason why we are putting more of this type of information, but a good discussion. I encourage the SBE to feel free to send questions and comments and she hopes this will stimulate discussions from the SBE to ask questions and give us advice on helping shape what the SCDE does. She thinks it is an important role for the SBE to play.

Mr. Butzon stated that he has periodically has conversations with the legislators that represent him. He feels that the SBE could be influential, in a good way. Superintendent Spearman agreed and stated that this is why she and the SCDE are doing this, to generate more conversation on what the SBE thinks is a good or bad idea. She has received positive and negative input on the reading panel. There were discussions on whether or not to appoint a reading panel or put it into law, which is true. In talking with Dr. Wright in Mississippi, who also has this panel, she explained that it has built the credibility and the influence that the committee has in making long term decisions like going to higher education and trying to change the Ed Prep program, rather than Superintendent Spearman just stating that higher education needs to do something different. By putting it in law, it has more force. She thinks that the SBE plays an important role in that, and she mentions to the SBE that two months ago, when she returned from the Literacy Conference, as programs are coming to us, from higher education, and through Mrs. Hipp's office, the Superintendent thinks that the SBE should ask more questions, are they teaching the strategies that work, or that teachers are saying helped them, or that they weren't prepared, and why do we need to give so much professional development to teachers, especially recent graduates in how to teach reading. Why are teachers not being taught this before they graduate college. She hopes those are questions that the SBE will be thinking about and do not hesitate to bring up those questions as we go through program reviews.

Mr. Butzon stated viewed the video of Dr. Wright's presentation to the GA and he was very impressed with it. He stated that the video was about one and one half hours and it was worth watching. He suggested that everyone on the SBE should watch the video.

Ms. Howard stated that she felt that the re-vamping of the SBE Committees and changing the meeting times of the committees has provided the committee members with more time for discussion of the items that come before each committee. The last two meetings of Ms. Howard's committee have been more informational for her group than any that she has previously sat on. Like today, her committee has had the opportunity for one

hour to sit with Dr. Mathis and discuss issues; ask questions; provide him with our concerns. She feels that by having a longer committee time has given all of the members a chance to discuss important issues. She was thankful for the change.

Chair Brennan thanked Ms. Howard and recognized Mr. Kobrovsky.

Mr. Kobrovsky had a question about the four-year-old program, the federal poverty level; and the participation at 185 percent, and if that is an income level. Dr. Mathis explained that the districts receive the federal formula if they do not qualify for the Medicaid funding. The federal formula is based on the number of people in a household, based on their family income as compared to this federal formula. Mr. Kobrovsky asked it was a specific the income level. Dr. Mathis stated that it changed yearly and he would check on that information for the SBE. He also stated that he would show the SBE how the formula was calculated. Dr. Mathis stated that most homes qualified under the Medicaid funding.

Chair Brennan recognized Dr. Green.

Dr. Green wanted to make a statement that obviously, districts have had some concerns relative to the SC Department of Social Services (DSS) requirements for 4K for many years, which have not been addressed. As we talk about expanding 4K to private and parochial schools; and eliminating the DSS requirements; which he is a bit skeptical about, because when public districts have been complaining for years, there has been no relief for public school districts. In the event this education reform bill does not pass, and it is not addressed, through the GA, as it relates to relief from DSS requirements, who is in charge of relaxing the DSS requirements. Superintendent Spearman stated that the recommendation came from the Governor's Office. He was the one to negotiate for it to expand the requirements. If the education reform bill does not pass, she feels certain that both the expansion and relaxation of the requirements will be put in a proviso in the budget bill. Ms. Hazelwood stated that DSS is a cabinet agency and the Governor has some power through an executive order, or by telling DSS to stand down, which would not be the ideal way to handle it, but he does have that power with a cabinet agency. Superintendent Spearman asked Dr. Mathis to clarify that the DSS regulations are relieved for public and private schools. Dr. Mathis stated that according to the proposal, it is for both public and private schools.

Dr. Green stated that his next area of concern was retention. All of the research that Dr. Green has done shows that there is limited benefit, and a lot of damage caused by retention. He is curious, as we looked toward the future, of using retention to improve literacy, where is the research to support that retention is an effective method. Dr. Mathis stated that he did not know if there was any research, and that is why Dr. Mathis believes that intervention is an important piece. Dr. Green stated that he is not for retention. Dr. Mathis stated that the retention of a child should be based on more than academics; there are many things that go into that decision. When you sit down with everyone involved, at the end of the meeting you need to weigh the benefits of retaining that child. If it is going to benefit the child then you retain the child, if it is not, then you figure out what you can do in the next level provide help to the child.

Finally, Dr. Green stated that he understood the Superintendent Spearman's and the SCDE's concerns about people who may have hired reading coaches who were not the most effective. He thinks they need to be very sensitive to who you assign to schools, because sometimes, you can do more damage than good. Remember, not everyone is necessarily a good fit for every environment. He is always concerned when he hears that the SCDE is going to pick the reading coaches. You cannot just look at the people's abilities; you also need to look at how they are going to fit into the environment. He is certain that the SCDE will do their due diligence, but they need to look at every aspect.

Chair Brennan asked if there were any other questions for Dr. Mathis. There being none, Chair Brennan introduced Donna Manning.

Ms. Manning stated that since the SBE received an extensive report on each of the following districts at the February meeting, this month she would be giving them a brief report.

04. Florence County School District Four (FCSD-4) Update—Donna Manning, Interim Director, School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement

FCSD-4 has been working with recruitment efforts; both principals have attended several career fairs, specifically the FCSD-1 career recruitment fair, and the Center for Educator Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement CERRA teacher recruitment fair. Brockington Elementary was able to secure two teachers. FCSD-4 conducted a Saturday Professional Development day that was conducted for elementary teachers and high school teachers. The focus was on assessment and curriculum review analysis at the elementary, middle, and high school levels. The focus was on ELA and math and worked together to analyze the recent district benchmarks and some of the other assessments that they have had within recent months. They have also implemented a new flexible intervention schedule to support the new academic goals.

Areas of progress were

- preparing for upcoming Title II audit;
- renewed all of the contracts for special education teachers.
 - There are zero current vacancies in that area.

Highlights were

- Middle School Junior Beta Club Induction;
- Black History Showcases at the elementary, middle, and high school level; and
- Black History Museum and invited the community to attend.

05. Allendale County School District (ACSD) Update—Donna Manning, Interim Director, School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement

Ms. Manning commended Dr. Gilmore and her team for doing a fantastic job on building community relationships. They conducted their monthly community meeting in February in conjunction with Family Literacy Month. Six hundred parents, students, and community members attended. Vendors and local authors were also present. The activities involved book giveaways, book signings, and training sessions. All students in attendance received free books and parents learned tips on how to help their children with literacy. Two hundred students at this meeting were recognized across the district for top performances on the IReady Diagnostic Assessment. District teachers were named for that month, and Allendale-Fairfax Middle School was the “Spotlight School of the Month”. The students participated in a living Black History Museum presentation, and the regional winners for the “Go IT App Development” competition, and the students did very well. The students were given awards and recognition for their submissions.

It was a robust month for professional development in the ACSD. Nine sessions were held for various faculty and staff. The topics were

- Assistant Principals’ Academy;
- Instructional Technology Training;
- Text-dependent Analogy;
- Imbedded Curriculum and Technology Training—2 classes;

- District-wide Principals' Meeting;
- Instructional Strategies;
- Faculty and Staff Professional Development Training; and
- New Teacher Induction.

Highlights were

- local businesses continue to support the ACSD;
- Mixon Oil Company donated \$500 to Allendale Elementary and the high school;
- the Elementary Spelling Bee was held on February 5, and all of the winners received trophies;
- the Allendale-Fairfax High School held its graduation of the Young Women's Empowerment Club;
- an Allendale senior earned the "Town of Allendale Citizenship Award" for outstanding student, and the student has also committed to attending North Greenville University in the fall on an academic and athletic scholarship; and
- observed National School Counselors' Week, February 3–7.

06. Williamsburg County School District (WCSD)—Donna Manning, Interim Director, School Transformation, Division of Federal Programs, Accountability, and School Improvement

In WCSD there were many activities in the community

- they opened their window for the 4K CERDEP applications to begin;
 - held a community information session that kicked off the opening of the applications.
- solicited support from various partnerships and organizations within the community to participate in the WCSD's Health and Safety Spring Fling coming up in May;
- will assist in the community census which will be held at the WCSD's offices;
 - will work with family engagement liaisons and will assist the community in and will help bring in community members to help assist them with filing their census information.
- they are looking to fill vacancies for Speech Language Pathologist; School Psychologists; Occupational Therapist and will be participating in recruitment fairs;
- held a job fair at the WCSD's offices;
- processing applications turned in by the principals in the district;
- held staff development on various topics: MTSS; Assessment; Standards Analysis; Data Analysis; Safety; Bus Driver training; Leadership Development, to name a few;
- Federal programs;
 - Implemented an after-school intervention program for eight of the Willowglen middle and high school students using Title I funds.
 - Implemented an after-school intense intervention program for middle and high school students district-wide using Title IV funds.
- a Special Services Retreat was held; and
- met with Willowglen staff to discuss transitioning of home-based services for those students attending Willowglen.

Highlights were

- a Kingstree student was chosen as a delegate to the Congress of the Future Medical Leaders Conference taking place this summer;
- high school students were also recognized at the SC Mock Trial Competition in the areas of professionalism and civility, most effective attorney, and most effective witness;
- three Hemingway elementary students were winners in the National Career Development Association's

Poetry Contest;

- staff members also received awards;
 - o District Nurse Award at the National Nurse Conference; and
 - o Speech Pathologist won a poster conference at her professional conference.

In closing, Ms. Manning stated that all three of these districts would go through a district-level external review during the spring and fall. Similar to the external review that we do with our CSI schools, except that level of review will be looking at the whole system, as opposed to looking at individual systems. They will look at how the whole district works, strengths, weaknesses, and areas that need growth. The ACSD and WCSD will get their review in April–May and FCSD-4 in the fall, which will align with their accreditation reviews.

This concluded Ms. Manning’s report.

Chair Brennan asked if there were any other questions. There was none.

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Chair Brennan stated that he had heard Superintendent Spearman speak on March 9, 2020, at the Palmetto Business Forum that is the CEO’s of the largest companies throughout SC. One of the things she addressed was the legislation making sure that when the work with these three districts (Allendale; Florence Four; and Williamsburg) has been completed, that the local board of trustees who allowed these schools to flounder are not allowed to retake possession of these districts. The CEO’s understand what Superintendent Spearman wants to do. Chair Brennan hopes that the GA understands what needs to be done to help these three districts. Superintendent Spearman stated that she enjoyed speaking at the Forum.

Superintendent Spearman wanted to make a clarification on the discussion about DSS and what the legislation states. Public schools and private schools, that are members of the South Carolina Association of Independent Schools Association (SCAIAS) and Christian Schools Association (CSA), will have regulations relaxed. For profit, private daycare centers will still have to be licensed by DSS.

Superintendent Spearman also should have mentioned that as of last night, we have a new school district, Clarendon County School District Four (formerly District One and Three). Senator Johnson and Representative Ridgeway appointed a transition team board to begin setting up the consolidation of the two districts into one. The new board will consist of some board members from Districts One and Three, along with some new members. The consolidation legislation for Hampton County School Districts One and Two has been introduced and received second reading in the Senate and it could have received third reading today, but she had not heard. There are also two more districts that are considering consolidation.

Chair Brennan asked if there was any other business to come before the board. Chair Brennan recognized Mr. Walters.

Mr. Walters commented on the passage of a Georgetown County school board member, Mr. Elery Little who was 92 years old. He was a life-long educator who began teaching in 1953 after his military service. He became principal at Pleasant Hill High School in 1969 and stayed there until he retired in 1993. He was elected to the local board in 2002 and was a very active member until the past few weeks because of his illness. Mr. Walters asked that everyone keep him and his family in their thoughts and prayers. Georgetown County appreciates Mr. Little’s years of service in education.

Chair Brennan reminded all members to turn in their travel forms prior to their departure.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the SBE adjourned at 2:28 p.m.